



# Progress Assessment of the UN towards Achievement of One UN Programme II Planned Results

## Consolidated Report



# Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms.....	2
Executive Summary .....	5
Introduction .....	13
Strategic Priority Area 1: .....	16
Strategic Priority Area 2: .....	28
Strategic Priority Area 3: .....	38
Strategic Priority Area 4: .....	47
Strategic Priority Area 5: .....	56
Strategic Priority Area 6: .....	64
Application of UN Programming Principles:.....	72
Conclusion.....	83
Annexes:.....	86

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

ALAC	Advice and Legal Aid Centres
ANF	Anti-Narcotics Force
AVRR	Assisted Voluntary Returns and Repatriation
BCC	Behaviour Change Communication
BHU	Basic Health Unit
BISP	Benazir Income Support Programme
CATS	Community Approaches to Total Sanitation
CCCM	Camp Coordination and Camp Management
CCD	Climate Change Division
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Violence Against Women
CFW	Cash for Work
CLTS	Community-Led Total Sanitation
CMAM	Community Based Management of Acute Malnutrition
CNIC	Computerized National Identity Card
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DCC	District Coordination Committee
DEWS	Disease Early Warning and Response System
DMA	Disaster Management Authority (National, Provincial and District DMAs)
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ECP	Election Commission of Pakistan
EE	Energy Efficient
EFA	Education For All
EFP	Employers Federation of Pakistan
EPI	Expanded Programme of Immunisation
ESP	Education Sector Plans
EVAWG	Eliminate Violence Against Women and Girls
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
FCS	Food Consumption Score
FIA	Federal Investigation Agency
FMD	Foot and Mouth Disease
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GE4DE	Gender Equality for Decent Employment
GHG	Greenhouse Gases
GLASS	Global Analysis and Assessment of Sanitation and Drinking Water
GLOF	Glacier Lake Outburst Floods
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
GRLI	Gender Responsive Labour Inspection
GSMAP	Global Satellite Mapping of Precipitation
HCFC	Hydrochlorofluorocarbons
HBW	Home-Based Workers
HySter	Hygiene, Sanitation and Water
IDP	Internally Displaced Persons
IMNCI	Integrated Management of Neonatal and Childhood Illness

IPMG	Inter-Provincial Ministerial Group
IYCF	Infant and Young Child Feeding
KAB	Knowledge About Business
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LEA	Law Enforcement Agency
LGRDD	Local Government and Rural Development Department
LHRD	Labour and Human Resource Department
LHW	Lady Health Worker
LNS	Lipid-Based Nutrient Supplements
MAF	MDG Acceleration Framework
MAM	Moderate Acute Malnutrition
MCW	Mother and Child Week
MNCH	Maternal, Newborn and Child Health
NADRA	National Database and Registration Authority
NCSW	National Commission on the Status of Women
NEIMS	National Environmental Information Management System
OOSC	Out-of-School Children
OPII	UN One Programme II
OTP	Outpatient Therapeutic Programme
PARC	Pakistan Agricultural Research Council
PATS	Pakistan Approach to Total Sanitation
PBS	Pakistan Bureau of Statistics
PHED	Public Health Engineering Department
PLW	Pregnant and Lactating Women
PMD	Pakistan Meteorological Department
PNC	Pakistan Nursing Council
PoR	Proof of Registration
PVTC	Pakistan Vocational Training Council
SAM	Severe Acute Malnutrition
SBA	Skilled Birth Attendant
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SGBV	Sexual and Gender Based Violence
SLTS	School Led Total Sanitation
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SMEDA	Small and Medium Enterprise Development Authority
SMI	Small and Medium Industries
TDP	Temporarily Displaced Person
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
VRP	Village Resource Person
WFC	Women Friendly Centres
WFS	Women Friendly Spaces
WPC	Women Parliamentary Caucus

## Executive Summary

### Background, Objectives and Methodology

Pakistan is currently in the third year of implementing the One UN Programme II (2013-2017). OPII comprises six Strategic Priority Areas (SPAs) which together address the major development challenges facing the country. This report presents the findings under the consultancy assignment 'Progress Assessment of the UN Agencies, Funds and Programmes towards the Achievement of the Planned One Programme II Results'. The assignment looked at progress made in implementation of OPII and application of UN programming principles, and carried out a meta-review of diverse programme and agency reports.

The overall aim was to identify any gaps/shortcomings and synthesise key findings from a wide range of reports in order to promote shared learning and thus ensure more effective approaches to addressing development challenges, both in the remaining period of OPII implementation, and when putting together and implementing future country programmes. The main sources used were SPA Annual Reports 2013 and 2014, UNOPII Annual Reports 2013 and 2014, UN agency annual reports and a wide range of project/programme reports, e.g. mid-term reviews, evaluations. The meta-review focused on identifying factors promoting effectiveness and sustainability

### SPA1: Vulnerable and Marginalized Populations have Equitable Access and Use of Quality Services

**Progress Assessment** - The UN strengthened the policy environment for access to sanitation services, quality drinking water and improved hygiene, and for social protection. UN efforts also contributed to development of strategies, actions plans and guidelines in a number of areas, e.g. the Comprehensive Multi-Year Plan 2014-18 for EPI. The UN provided support for research and improved data collection and analysis in key sectors of health, WatSan, education and child protection. But little appears to have been done to strengthen accountability systems and promote access by rights holders (Joint Output 1.1.3).

A major focus of the UN was on promoting vaccination and eradicating polio; the UN's Polio Plus projects used creative ways to mobilize communities in high-risk areas to take action for polio eradication. The HySter (acronym for hygiene, sanitation and drinking water) campaign promoted behavioural change in target communities. UN technical assistance enabled scaling up of community outreach methods in provincial AIDS control programmes, and the UN worked to raise awareness of drug use and supported harm reduction services. The UN carried out advocacy to raise political support for reproductive health and family planning; youth were particularly targeted in the provision of reproductive health services.

The UN carried out a number of interventions to build capacity to reduce maternal and newborn mortality, including development of standards, guidelines and training manuals to strengthen MNCH. UN support for the disease early warning system (DEWS) resulted in outbreak alerts and quick responses, preventing further disease spread within communities. An important initiative was piloting of innovative financing models and voucher schemes for MNCH. However, little appears to have been done to support provincial governments to put in place long-term human resource management strategies and plans (Joint Output 1.3.3).

**Meta-Review Findings** - Public-private partnerships and community-based solutions such as LHWs, can be an effective approach to addressing public sector constraints in health care delivery such as lack of staff. There is a critical link between access to sanitation facilities (in the home) and avoidance of gender violence; this aspect should be consciously highlighted in behaviour change strategies. Use of diverse approaches, e.g. integration with administration of other vaccines, was effective in promoting polio vaccination – showing that even seemingly insurmountable obstacles can be overcome. Convergent programming is an effective way to address needs in different sectors (e.g. health, WASH) and positive impacts are amplified. Ongoing stigma and discrimination make it difficult for people with HIV/AIDS to access services. Establishment of a rights-based approach to create an enabling environment for treatment, use of opioid substitution treatment for drug users with HIV and use of community health workers, could overcome these issues.

## **SPA2: Inclusive Economic Growth through the Development of Sustainable Livelihoods**

**Progress Assessment** - UN initiatives to promote agriculture-based livelihoods featured policy level support as well as direct on-ground assistance to communities, e.g. establishment of farmer field schools, analysis of value chains and recommendations for improvement. Engagement with the Sindh and Balochistan governments helped identify opportunities for tourism alongside safeguarding cultural heritage. A major focus of UN efforts was on 'revamping' the technical and vocational education and training system in Pakistan, e.g. through support for the Punjab and Sindh TEVTAs. Projects in those provinces aimed at empowering vulnerable groups through education, employment and training. UN livelihood support projects, working with certified vocational training providers, helped improve marketable skills among refugees. The UN helped raise awareness among women, in particular home-based workers (HBWs) of their labour rights.

The UN helped promote the growth of sustainable and inclusive small and medium enterprises (SMEs) and industries (SMIs) through identification and formulation of investment opportunities in various sectors, e.g. leather, and through technical support for SMEDA. UN efforts to promote clean production focused on supporting Pakistani compliance with its international obligations to phase out release of ozone-depleting HCFCs. The UN also supported implementation of the National Climate Change Policy at 15 sites of critically threatened ecosystems. A number of initiatives were carried out to promote clean energy use, e.g. biomass gasification for power generation and for thermal applications, and installation of solar lights. The UN also carried out a number of initiatives to promote trade and development and help Pakistan's economy integrate equitably in the global economy. Quality control was one of the main areas of support, leading to establishment of a sound accreditation regime, and lifting of a seven-year ban on Pakistani fish exports to the EU.

The UN conducted a number of studies on population-related issues, e.g. a study on internal migration and urbanization in Sindh and Balochistan. In order to build capacity for demographic research, the UN trained staff members of the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics on GIS technology and tools, and trained provincial demographers in collecting, analysing and reporting population data.

**Meta-Review Findings** - When promoting livelihood restoration for communities traditionally engaged in agriculture (farming), in the short-term (relief and early recovery phases) it could be

more effective to support income generation through livestock. Rather than carry out a wide range of different livelihood restoration programmes, it could be more effective to carry out fewer interventions with a smaller number of implementing partners. Livelihood restoration cannot be brought about quickly, and support therefore needs to be provided for a significant period of time. Interventions should aim to be holistic – addressing all aspects, e.g. development of skills for handicraft production should be accompanied by training and support to access markets. Having some sort of institutional set-up at district level can greatly facilitate stakeholder engagement, provide opportunities to forge strong partnerships with government agencies and others, and help ensure sustainability of programme interventions. Interventions to promote industrial development are most effective when they involve close collaboration between government, the private sector and the UN. While Pakistan's export quality regime has strengthened greatly, private sector involvement should be encouraged to foster competition and reduce costs.

### **SPA3: Increased National Resilience to Disasters, Crises and External Shocks**

**Progress Assessment** - UN efforts in collaboration with the Pakistan Meteorological Department (PMD), DMAs and others resulted in improved flood management and early warning systems. The UN helped the NDMA to promote coordination with provincial and district disaster management authorities. It also helped improve disaster preparedness and response mechanisms in a number of multi-hazard districts. The UN worked extensively with government to align disaster resilience programmes with national development priorities. UN efforts led to gender being mainstreamed in DRR planning in Balochistan and at national level. The UN spearheaded training platforms and developed a bilingual manual on DRR to strengthen the institutional capacities of federal, provincial, district and local disaster risk management committees for policy-making planning and development. Measures to prepare communities for disasters included putting up warehouses in 21 districts to stockpile supplies and training communities in DRR. In the wake of the 2014 floods, the UN assisted many communities to 'build back better' using DRR construction methods.

The UN piloted a number of initiatives at community level to mitigate the effects of climate change, e.g. use of improved cooking and heating methods. The UN also contributed to conservation work in the wetlands and in juniper forests. The UN worked to revive the international 'Man and Biosphere' Programme in Pakistan, and organized meetings focusing on the impact of climate change on natural ecosystems, bringing together stakeholders from government, the UN, academia and environmentalists.

In the wake of the 2014 security operations in North Waziristan Agency and displacement of some 1.4 million people, the UN provided a multi-sector humanitarian response spanning health, nutrition, water and sanitation, education and child protection, and particularly targeting disadvantaged women and children. The UN helped form 670 community organizations to support livelihood and DRR activities through the cash for work modality. As the security situation improved and people were able to move back to NWA, the UN supported this process through provision of food items, crop production inputs, livestock and poultry packages. UN support to tackle narcotics trafficking focused on building capacities of law enforcement agencies and on promoting collaboration between Pakistan and its neighbours. To tackle human trafficking, the UN conducted a pioneering public awareness campaign covering



trafficking and points of entry and exit, which targeted specific provinces. It also held regional meetings on trafficking and migrant smuggling.

**Meta-Review Findings** - Investment in research and conduct of baseline assessments (as stand-alone projects) *prior* to programme design can help ensure effectiveness. It is important to involve local communities in interventions to benefit them, and to draw on local knowledge and experience when deciding on the best approach. It is also important to adapt interventions to suit local needs and tastes and to fit in with local norms and constraints. Highlighting direct and indirect (less obvious) benefits of different interventions can help win over communities and encourage them to use/adopt them. Using 'clean' heating technology, for example, reduces use of wood fuel and emission of GHG, but also means less smoke in people's homes and improved health outcomes. There is scope for regional learning in relation to climate change challenges and opportunities for this should be actively explored and availed.

#### **SPA4: Strengthened Governance and Social Cohesion**

**Progress Assessment** - The UN provided technical assistance for the promulgation of provincial labour laws, and supported federal and provincial governments in strengthening labour administration. Parliamentary Committees were supported in conducting public hearings and consultations, carrying out outreach, research and effective government oversight. The UN worked closely with the Climate Change Division to analyse urban development and formulate a national framework for this. Women's empowerment was a major focus of UN efforts: promoting women's political participation and supporting the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to carry out gender mainstreaming. However, there is little evidence of other initiatives to enable civil society and the media to promote participation of people in democratic processes and public dialogue. The UN assisted the ECP to carry out other major improvements in electoral systems.

The main mechanisms through which the UN has promoted access to justice for the poor and marginalized are provision of legal advice and aid, and promotion of alternative dispute resolution. The UN helped refugees and asylum seekers in Pakistan secure their legal rights. Other initiatives, mostly in KP, targeted different aspects of the criminal justice system: police, prosecution service, courts and prisons. The UN also supported drafting of the KP Social Protection Policy, and subsequent implementation. The success of women friendly spaces and centres set up by the UN, prompted the KP Government to take over responsibility for these.

The UN promoted peace building through a number of social cohesion measures, largely focused on the education sector, e.g. mainstreaming social cohesion and resilience in continuous professional development programmes for teachers. A major focus of UN efforts was on birth registration, both raising awareness of the importance of this, and building capacity of governments to carry this out. The UN provided extensive support for both the management of refugees within Pakistan, and to facilitate repatriation of Afghan refugees as well as IDPs from conflict in FATA. In the wake of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, the UN partnered with both federal and provincial governments to operationalise frameworks and forums to realize the benefits of devolution. Considerable support was provided in this regard in Balochistan, e.g. the UN helped set up the Chief Minister's Policy Reform Unit in Quetta. The UN also supported provincial governments to carry out a number of specific devolved functions, e.g. control of foot and mouth disease.



**Meta-Review Findings** - E-learning for law enforcement agencies can be a cost-effective, accessible and sustainable way to promote learning, capable of reaching thousands of people across the country. Cost reduction – finding cheap, local sources of products rather than expensive imports – can ensure ready availability of such products and promote sustainability. Programme interventions should seek to identify cost-effective solutions (including if necessary building local capacity for production). While it can be convenient for UN programmes to engage with larger stakeholders (e.g. in the case of tackling FMD, large dairy producers/commercial units) rather than multiple smaller ones (small farmers/individual households with livestock), it is important to engage with and support the latter. Livestock management at household level is typically carried out (to a large extent) by women, and interventions to improve livestock management should therefore aim to include women.

#### **SPA5: Gender Equality and Social Justice**

**Progress Assessment** - The UN provided technical assistance for the formulation of provincial frameworks for gender equality in Balochistan, Sindh, KP and FATA, and passage of Domestic Violence Bills in line with CEDAW in Sindh, Balochistan and PAK. It also engaged intensively with the Inter-Provincial Ministerial Group on Women's Development to prioritize and address key women's issues. The UN's work with the ECP led to it adopting a gender mainstreaming strategy, and it organized a regional stakeholder meeting leading to commitment to a regional agenda to promote women's political participation. The UN strengthened Women Parliamentary Caucuses by drafting strategic plans for four provincial WPC. It generated a number of knowledge products supporting formulation of gender responsive policies and evidence-based decision-making. However, little seems to have been done to generate sex-disaggregated data to support such decision-making.

Interventions to promote political, economic, social and legal rights of all, especially excluded groups, were carried out in a number of provinces and regions, leading to adoption of Youth Policies in Balochistan, KP, PAK and Gilgit-Baltistan, and establishment of the Punjab Youth Parliamentary Caucus. The UN played a key role in bringing about the Integrated Project on Child and Bonded Labour, to be implemented over seven years in 36 districts of Punjab, partly with government funds. As well as government, the UN partnered with other stakeholders (workers and employers groups) to implement international labour standards. Particular focus was placed on promoting labour rights for women, including implementation of gender responsive labour inspection and adoption of home based worker legislation. Progress was also made in the areas of child protection and gender-based violence, e.g. passage of a Punjab bill increasing the minimum age of marriage for girls to 18 years.

The UN carried out a number of initiatives to promote media freedom and safety of journalists, e.g. the UN Action Plan on Safety of Journalists and Issue of Impunity campaign (Pakistan is one of five pilot countries for this). The UN supported monitoring and reporting by civil society bodies on sexual and gender-based violence and on HIV. Technical assistance was provided to align the civil society response to HIV to the national response. UN engagement with the Inter-Provincial Working Group on Women's Development led to it adopting a set of key indicators on CEDAW reporting. The UN also supported relevant entities to prepare the Beijing+20 National Report, and the 5<sup>th</sup> periodic report on the UN CRC.

**Meta-Review Findings** - When trying to bring about reform a multi-pronged approach comprising (as relevant) advocacy and legislative change, engagement with government and other stakeholders at all levels (national, provincial and local), mobilization and organization of affected groups, and on-ground practical interventions to improve the condition of affected groups is important. Mobilizing and organizing vulnerable groups into 'collectives' (e.g. associations, unions, action groups) will greatly enhance their position in relation to duty bearers. NGOs can play a critical role in grassroots level mobilization and organization of community members, but it is important to ensure that mobilized groups do not become dependent on NGOs. Giving home based workers support and training to engage in alternative sources of livelihood, such as entrepreneurship, can help increase their income significantly. Hire of dedicated personnel to address gender-based violence (GBV) by UN agencies can facilitate mainstreaming of GBV across different sectors, e.g. health, education.

#### **SPA6: Food and Nutrition Security for the Most Vulnerable Groups**

**Progress Assessment** - The UN took an integrated approach to tackling food insecurity, supporting the development of multi-sector federal and provincial food security policies and strategies, providing food assistance tied to participation in work schemes (e.g. 68,000 households in FATA took part in such a scheme in 2014), and promoting livelihoods and income generation in diverse sectors (e.g. training on crop management, provision of quality seeds, vaccination of livestock). UN efforts led to high level government commitment to food security. UN technical guidance improved preparedness and responsiveness for this, including food and cash aid distribution modalities.

The UN supported all four provinces and two regions to develop multi-sector nutrition policies and strategies. The UN targeted infants and children, pregnant and lactating women and adolescent girls through various large-scale feeding programmes. The FATA school feeding programme led to the additional benefit of increased enrolment and attendance. Lady health workers were very effective in taking nutrition messages to rural communities and promoting practices such as exclusive breast-feeding for six months. Community-based management of acute malnutrition (CMAM) programmes were carried out on a large scale. The UN responded to the food crisis in Tharparkar, Sindh, by setting up a nutrition stabilization centre and feeding programmes for children and PLWs.

**Meta-Review Findings** - It is important to involve target communities in identification and prioritization of DRR and other physical infrastructure schemes (in the context of cash for work/food for work programmes). In the context of humanitarian responses and which aid modality to use, cash transfers have many advantages, notably low distribution costs and (often) beneficiary preference, but OPII experience suggests that provision of in kind (food) aid can be better at ensuring beneficiaries meet food consumption targets. Capacity for local production of lipid-based nutrient supplements (LNS) was developed through UN technical assistance, showing that it is possible to incentivise and support private sector involvement *without any financial investment* by the UN. But post-crisis, some manufacturers gave up LNS production – with serious implications for supply in future emergencies. Some method for ensuring sustained local LNS production capacity needs to be found. In rural areas lacking health facilities (as in many parts of Balochistan), lady health workers can be effectively used to treat both MAM cases and SAM cases without medical complications.

## Meta-Review Findings Common to all SPAs

A number of common themes and lessons emerged from the meta-review with relevance across the whole of OPII: Stakeholder engagement is critical to ensuring coordination, effectiveness and sustainability, and needs to take place at all levels (as appropriate) District-level institutional arrangement for engagement can be particularly important. Alignment of interventions with government strategies, policies and plans increases the chances of scale-up/adoption of those interventions by government, and is more sustainable than setting up parallel systems using NGOs, for example. Use of subsidies/incentives to achieve programme objectives should be avoided since these create dependence and problems when subsidies come to an end. Often there are indirect as well as direct benefits of interventions, and these should be highlighted too.

Community participation is vital, as programme interventions can gain from local knowledge and experience, and this promotes effectiveness and builds ownership. Interventions should be adapted to local tastes and preferences. Private sector entities can help fill gaps/partner the public sector, particularly in remote rural areas. Local production capacity (e.g. for nutrient supplements) should be supported both to reduce costs and ensure regular supply. A number of evaluation reports noted the need for improved coordination between UN agencies. Programme interventions aiming at bringing about long-term change, e.g. livelihood restoration/generation among vulnerable populations, can sometimes be more effective by concentrating intense efforts on a few, rather than spreading support out thinly over many. All programmes should proactively identify and implement activities to support and empower women.

## Application of UN Programming Principles

**Gender Equality** - This is by far the UN programming principle that has been most uniformly and successfully 'integrated' in OPII implementation. Efforts for gender equality promotion under OPII fall into the following broad categories: advocacy and policy support to create an enabling legislative and policy environment (e.g. passage of Domestic Violence Bills in Sindh, Balochistan and PAK); support for gender-disaggregated research to provide an evidence base for effective planning (e.g. support to the ECP to produce sex-disaggregated figures of votes cast); advocacy and capacity building to integrate gender in planning and development processes and in humanitarian responses (e.g. mainstreaming of gender in the Balochistan Monsoon Contingency Plan and DRR plan); support for women's participation in decision-making and politics (e.g. strengthening of Women Parliamentary Caucuses); interventions to meet specific service delivery needs of women (e.g. capacity building for MNCH); promotion of access to justice for women (e.g. capacity building of duty bearers to address SGBV and setting up of women friendly centres and spaces); and skills enhancement of women and support for income generation (e.g. vocational training, advocacy for rights for home-based workers).

**Human Rights Based Approach** - UN application of HRBA is seen most obviously in measures taken to promote child protection, labour rights, fair elections, media freedom, monitoring and reporting on human rights, and to tackle sexual and gender based violence. It is also seen in the stress placed on ensuring vulnerable and marginalized groups – women, refugees, people with HIV and so on – have access to rights and services. However, there are a number of areas where

OPII implementation appears to have fallen short, notably in strengthening accountability systems and in building capacity of national stakeholders to promote and protect human rights.

***Environmental Sustainability*** – This programming principle has largely been applied in the context of SPA2 (promoting sustainable livelihoods) and SPA3 (tackling climate change). Efforts to ensure environmental sustainability have also been made in relation to other SPAs, e.g. promotion of PATS in WASH interventions, mainstreaming of environmental sustainability in all aspects of refugee/IDP camp management. Overall, however, the principle of environmental sustainability has been applied far less uniformly across OPII than either gender equality or the human rights based approach.

# Introduction

## Background and Objectives

Pakistan is currently in the third year of implementing the One UN Programme II (2013-2017). OPII represents the overarching development framework for all UN agencies, funds and programmes in Pakistan. OPII comprises six Strategic Priority Areas (SPAs)<sup>1</sup> which together address the major development challenges facing the country.

This report presents the findings under the consultancy assignment 'Progress Assessment of the UN Agencies, Funds and Programmes towards the Achievement of the Planned One Programme II Results'. The assignment looked at progress made in implementation of OPII and application of UN programming principles, and carried out a meta-review of diverse programme and agency reports. The objectives were to:

- a) Give an assessment of progress made to date, and identify any areas in which progress is falling short;
- b) Identify factors contributing to effectiveness and sustainability of OPII interventions;
- c) Give an assessment of application of three UN programming principles and identify areas in which this is falling short.

The overall aim was to identify any gaps/shortcomings and synthesise key findings from a wide range of reports, in order to promote shared learning and increase the knowledge and evidence base for the UN Country Team. This in turn can ensure more effective approaches to addressing development challenges, both in the remaining period of OPII implementation, and when putting together and implementing future country programmes.

## Methodology

### *Progress Assessment*

The progress assessment has been carried out solely by joint outputs and not joint outcomes. While some figures (numbers reached through interventions, etc.) are given, the overall stress is on summarising key approaches, interventions and achievements and relating these to the OPII planned joint outputs. The main sources for the progress assessment were SPA reports 2013, SPA reports 2014, One UN Programme II Annual Report 2013 and One UN Programme II Annual Report 2014. Individual UN agency annual reports were also consulted.

### *Meta-Review*

There is a vast amount of information contained in individual OPII programme evaluation reports and UN agency annual reports. The aim of the meta-review was to synthesise key findings from these for shared learning. A typical evaluation report looks at relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. Given its wider learning objective, this meta-review

---

<sup>1</sup> SPA1 – Vulnerable and marginalized populations have equitable access and use of quality services; SPA2 - Inclusive economic growth through the development of sustainable livelihoods; SPA3 – Increased national resilience to disasters, crises and external shocks; SPA4 - Strengthened governance and social cohesion; SPA5 - Gender equality and social justice; SPA6 - Food and nutrition security for the most vulnerable groups.

focuses on effectiveness and sustainability. Even within this narrow focus, the review has been selective. The key questions it seeks to answer are as follows:

- What approaches were taken to achieve development goals?
- What factors contributed to the programme achieving development goals?
- What challenges were faced and how were these overcome?
- What measures have been taken or need to be taken to ensure sustainability?

The answers to these questions form the foundation for lesson learning.

An element of subjectivity is implicit in the approach taken to carry out this meta-review – both because of the narrow focus, and because only a limited amount of information can be included. Each individual programme report/agency report contains a vast amount of information, much of which will be of use to other practitioners. However, the meta-review has to be selective and only present those findings with the greatest relevance for the most practitioners. The parameters for what to include and what to leave are not clear-cut – hence the subjectivity. Nonetheless, every effort has been made to ensure the most important findings for OPII implementation are given.

This meta-review report is based on a review of a very wide range of documents: project mid-term evaluation reports, final evaluation reports, case studies, project ‘communications’ material and UN agency annual reports. These reports vary hugely in their objectives, structure, approach and content. Devising a common framework for analysis was therefore challenging. The framework that was used (see **Annex 1** for template) comprised the following sections: basic programme information; main programme components; key outputs/achievements; success factors; challenges; lessons and – where information was available – application of UN programming principles. As noted, the reports reviewed varied greatly in structure and content, and not all yielded information relevant to the entire analysis framework. For each report, the analysis was carried out using as much information as was given.

With regard to sources, as explained these were a range of programme documents as well as agency annual reports. The full list of reports reviewed is given in **Annex 2**. OPII runs from 2013-2017 but many programmes have different timeframes, some starting before OPII was launched and ending during it, others starting during OPII and planned to continue after its completion. The criterion applied when deciding whether or not to include an evaluation report was whether some period of programme implementation falls within the OPII timeframe, i.e. from 2013 onwards – if it does the report was included; if it does not the report was not reviewed. Thus a programme that commenced in 2009 and ended in June 2013 would be included in the review, but one ending in 2012 would not.

It is important to stress that the meta-review is based solely on the programme reports that were available; these do not necessarily represent the full range of activities being carried out under each SPA. As such, the meta-review does not necessarily cover the entire gamut of SPAs and OPII. For example, there are a number of programme reports detailing initiatives to promote food security and tackle malnutrition, so SPA6 is well-represented. But there are no programme reports detailing education sector initiatives, no reports describing initiatives to strengthen electoral processes, none on promoting women’s political participation or strengthening nursing provision.....all areas in which the UN is doing substantial work (as detailed in progress assessment write-ups). This ‘gap’ in programme reports translates into

significant gaps in coverage of SPAs (in this case SPA1, SPA4 and SPA5) in the meta-review. Agency annual reports were reviewed as well but these, by their very nature, provide far less 'qualitative' information than programme evaluation reports. In sum, the meta-review synthesises findings from available documents rather than from across OPII.

### *Application of UN Programming Principles*

The Pakistan One UN Programme II includes the application of key UN normative and enabling principles. The three normative principles are gender equality, human rights based approach and environmental sustainability, while the two enabling principles are capacity development and results-based management. The two enabling principles offer the means to make the normative principles operational. This report focuses on application of the three normative principles – gender equality, HRBA and environmental sustainability – in OPII implementation to date. The write-up is presented by programming principle rather than by SPA. Hence, for example, it reviews how the principle of gender equality is being applied across all six SPAs rather than under each individual SPA. Effort has been made to ensure that all SPAs are adequately represented in the write-ups. The following sources were used: SPA reports 2013, SPA reports 2014, One UN Programme II Annual Report 2013 and One UN Programme II Annual Report 2014. Individual UN agency annual reports were also consulted.

### **Outline of Report**

The findings of this report are presented by Strategic Priority Areas (SPAs). Each SPA section is divided into two parts: part one gives an assessment of progress made, while part two details the findings from the meta-review of programme and agency reports (starting with a summary of key points). The final section of the report looks at the application of UN programming principles: gender equality, human rights based approach (HRBA) and environmental sustainability.



## **Strategic Priority Area 1:**

**Vulnerable and Marginalized Populations  
have Equitable Access and Use of Quality  
Services**

## 1.1 SPA1: Progress Assessment

Pakistan faces serious challenges with regard to service delivery, manifested in its projected failure (at the time of OPII formulation) to achieve most MDGs. The 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment devolved responsibility for basic social services wholly to provincial governments – posing new challenges. OPII calls for the UN to support provincial governments in carrying out their responsibilities through upstream advocacy, legislative and policy work to create an enabling environment for equitable access to quality services, and downstream support to officials in delivering services. OPII places great stress on ensuring marginalized and vulnerable groups are supported to access services. Alongside interventions to improve services, it calls for engagement with communities to promote safe practices (e.g. in care of newborns) which can significantly improve human development outcomes.

### **Outcome 1.1 – Policy environment, legislation, budgetary allocation and accountability mechanisms strengthened in support of equitable access to social and basic services for human development**

*Output 1.1.1 Key national and provincial stakeholders develop and implement equity-focused, child and gender sensitive laws, policies and strategies*

*Output 1.1.2 Equity focused and gender sensitive research and evaluation used for improved policy planning, monitoring and budget allocations*

*Output 1.1.3 Accountability systems and structures are functional, strengthened and accessed by rights holders*

Under outcome 1.1, joint output 1.1.1, the UN strengthened the policy environment for access to sanitation services, safe drinking water and improved hygiene, and for child protection. Notable achievements were approval or drafting of Sanitation Policies and Drinking Water Policies in all four provinces plus FATA, and approval or drafting of Child Marriage Restraint Acts, Child Protection Acts and Prohibition of Child Employment Acts in a number of provinces.

UN efforts also contributed to development of strategies, action plans and guidelines in a number of areas. Examples are the Comprehensive Multi-Year Plan 2014-18 for the Expanded Programme on Immunisation (EPI), Pakistan Country Strategy for HIV Testing and HIV Communication Strategy, provincial AIDS control programmes, SOPs for Child Protection Units and a draft Environmental Health Action Plan to reduce the environmental burden of disease and ensure people are safeguarded from environmental hazards and risks. A National Maternal, Newborn and Child Health (MNCH) Acceleration Plan focused on improving MNCH services in the 70 neediest districts through best practices and ‘quick wins’. Such strategies/action plans, prepared in consultation with stakeholders, will guide service providers to address priority needs, make efficient use of resources and improve quality of service delivery.

Under joint output 1.1.2, the UN provided support for research and improved data collection and analysis in key sectors of health, WatSan, education and child protection. Technical assistance was provided to health management systems at federal and provincial level to collect sex disaggregated data – thereby enabling health strategies to address the specific needs of women, men, boys, girls and young children. Equity analysis of immunization coverage and

access in select districts and a national KAPB study looking at barriers to immunization, will help improve delivery of immunization services and develop a national communication strategy to promote routine immunization. The UN helped initiate its Global Analysis and Assessment of Sanitation and Drinking Water (GLASS) in Pakistan. GLASS complements the sector review process, by supporting assessment of the enabling environment and identifying barriers and enablers.

In the education sector, the UN provided assistance in a number of studies: the 2013 Out-of-School Children (OOSC) Study, the findings of which informed provincial planning and development of a national plan of action; the Social Cohesion and Resilience Analysis for Pakistan looking at education's contribution to social cohesion; and a capacity gap analysis in Balochistan, establishing a framework to strengthen government capacity to plan, monitor and improve education provision. The UN also managed to leverage resources to support Pakistan's alignment with the Global Partnership for Education (GPE), and it supported the National Education for All 2015 Review (EFA). In the area of child protection, provincial governments were assisted in carrying out diverse studies: in Punjab, to conduct a child-responsive budget analysis; in KP and Karachi to assess the situation of adolescents in urban areas; and in all four provinces, to map and assess child protection systems. All these studies will inform planning and implementation of suitable interventions.

In relation to output 1.1.3, the notification of Children's Commissioners for federal and provincial ombudsmen systems was a significant step in setting up independent accountability mechanisms accessible by rights holders. However, there appears to be little other activity undertaken to strengthen accountability systems and promote access by rights holders.

**Outcome 1.2 – Increased public awareness/behaviour change to ensure vulnerable and excluded populations practice safe behaviour, as well as access and use quality services, including housing**

*Output 1.2.1 Vulnerable people, in particular women and children, have access to information relating to safe practices and behaviours*

*Output 1.2.2 Vulnerable groups participate more actively in the development, implementation and monitoring of programmes designed to increase access and utilization of quality basic social services*

*Output 1.2.3 Increased availability of integrated sexual and reproductive health information and services for adolescents and youth, especially the most marginalized*

In relation to output 1.2.1, a major focus of the UN was on promoting vaccination and eradicating polio. To prevent pneumonia, the UN rolled out its pneumococcal vaccine (PCV 10) programme; it supported the health departments of KP and Punjab to develop an integrated package for delivery of the expanded programme of immunization (EPI), MNCH and nutrition services; and the bi-annual mother and child weeks (MCWs) reached millions of children and women - their success led to provincial governments taking over the planning and funding of MCWs. The UN's Polio Plus projects used creative ways to mobilize communities in high-risk areas to take action for polio eradication. [Polio Plus recognises that polio eradication requires efforts on multiple fronts.] Social mobilizers played a key role, communicating the importance of polio vaccination to communities as well as collecting important data on why children are missed during vaccination campaigns – with accessibility and availability identified as greater

challenges than religious objections. Other UN initiatives included providing technical guidance to authorities on effective vaccination targeting, support for rehabilitation units working with polio affected youth, and establishment of the first electronic national cold chain equipment manager (CCEM) database to improve vaccine management.

HySter (an acronym from hygiene, sanitation and water) is a UN campaign being conducted in Pakistan aimed at bringing about behavioural change in targeted communities. Specifically, it promotes safe excreta and waste disposal through school-led mobilisation and demonstration of appropriate technology. The Pakistan Approach to Total Sanitation (PATS) helped hundreds of thousands of people gain access to secure sanitation facilities and safe drinking water. Technical assistance from the UN enabled scaling up of community outreach methods in provincial AIDS control programmes: leading to women being provided with confidential HIV counselling and testing, and information on safe practices and behaviours. The UN also worked to raise awareness of drug use by supporting harm reduction services and building the capacity of partners to deliver these services to target populations, which include female drug users, female prisoners and Afghan refugees. To address the growing threat of extremism and militancy in KP, the UN carried out a public awareness campaign targeting policy makers, advocating for the inclusion of 'education for sustainable development' (promoting peace and pluralism) in curricula and textbooks.

In relation to output 1.2.3, the UN focused advocacy efforts on raising political support for family planning, with the goal of increasing programming and budgeting for reproductive health and family planning. To increase access to family planning, the UN launched the Family Planning Voucher – an innovative health financing intervention benefitting thousands of poor and vulnerable women in 11 remote and disadvantaged districts. The UN End Fistula Campaign supported one national and six regional fistula centres providing free obstetric fistula treatment and patient rehabilitation.

With regard to youth specifically, the UN supported the training of health care providers from ten districts on youth friendly reproductive services. Youth in Punjab were facilitated to access reproductive health services through the establishment of an Adolescent Counselling Cell in a Lahore hospital, in collaboration with the Population Welfare Department. A district-level counselling programme provides free advice and family planning services to newly-wed couples for the first two years of marriage.

**Outcome 1.3 – Capacity for equitable social service delivery improved at all levels, including using innovative technology**

*Output 1.3.1 Duty bearers are empowered and able to deliver efficient, accountable and transparent services to the most vulnerable communities*

*Output 1.3.2 Provincial departments identify and channel resources to the most vulnerable communities*

*Output 1.3.3 Provincial departments put in place long term human resource management strategies and plans*

*Output 1.3.4 Models for mapping and reaching basic services to the chronically underserved groups are developed, implemented, evaluated and successful models scaled up.*

With regard to output 1.3.1, the UN carried out a number of interventions to build capacity to reduce maternal and newborn mortality. The Pakistan Nursing Council (PNC) and the Midwifery Association of Pakistan, as well as provincial MNCH programmes were supported to strengthen midwifery education and regulation, and raise the image of the profession. Core trainers were prepared to teach skilled birth attendants (SBAs) in ten districts of Sindh. The helping babies breathe training is an important measure to reduce birth asphyxia. IMNCI was a related focus area of UN capacity building efforts. Medical colleges in Punjab and KP were supported to include IMNCI training in undergraduate courses for doctors. The UN supported the development of standards, guidelines and training manuals to strengthen MNCH, and helped establish centres of excellence for training and skill development across the country, equipped with modern technology and facilities.

The UN worked to build capacity of care providers at prevention of parent-to-child HIV transmission centres, in particular to strengthen service provision and referral for HIV-positive pregnant women. UN support for the disease early warning and response system (DEWS) - providing surveillance data, weekly reports from almost 90 districts and monitoring of priority diseases – resulted in outbreak alerts and quick responses, preventing further spread of disease within communities. In the education sector, the UN helped build capacity for accreditation and quality assurance of teachers. It also trained provincial government education officials on child friendly education, and provided technical input to education sector plans (ESPs) drawing on consultations with diverse stakeholders (teachers, pupils, politicians, religious leaders).

An important initiative in relation to outputs 1.3.2/1.3.4 was piloting of innovative financing models and voucher schemes for MNCH. These were tested, evaluated and handed over to the Sindh Health Department to further scale up and incorporate into government planning and budgeting. To ensure access to health care for marginalized and vulnerable groups, the UN advocated for the expansion of health insurance schemes across Pakistan. It developed a roadmap for establishing a national gender-sensitive health insurance scheme for marginalized women and children. As well as giving poor and vulnerable access to healthcare, the programme will help revolutionise Pakistan's health infrastructure.

Little appears to have been done under output 1.3.3: supporting provincial governments to put in place long-term human resource management strategies and plans.

## 1.2 SPA1: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*The meta-review examined evaluation reports related to programmes addressing healthcare issues in rural Sindh, and ensuring access to clean drinking water and sanitation facilities in flood/crisis affected parts of the country. Relevant agency reports were also reviewed.*

Alignment of programme components and approaches with national/provincial policies and programmes was highlighted as a success factor: this facilitates scale-up of interventions and their adoption by government – thereby ensuring sustainability.

Public-private partnerships can be an effective approach to addressing public sector constraints such as lack of qualified staff. Community-based solutions, such as lady health workers and mobilization/training of community members to carry out certain duties, can also be efficient ways of ensuring service provision in areas lacking health care facilities – especially rural areas.

It is important to strengthen both demand and supply sides when improving service provision. Raising demand through behaviour change communication strategies will only be effective if the supply side is able to meet increased demand.

UN advocacy to add chlorhexidine (CHX) (antiseptic for treatment of newborns) to national and provincial essential drugs lists was accompanied by engagement with pharmaceutical companies for local production of CHX. This approach ensured that increased demand could be matched by increased *local* supply.

Carrying out interventions through NGOs and local implementing partners can be a very effective and efficient way of achieving programme targets. But it is important to keep long-term sustainability in mind. Ultimately, this depends on improving service delivery through the public sector.

There is a critical link between access to sanitation facilities for women and gender violence: when women lack such facilities in their homes they are forced to go out in hours of darkness, exposing them to risks of assault as well as accusations of illicit relations with men. Providing sanitation facilities in the home removes this risk. This aspect should be consciously included in programme design and highlighted in behaviour change strategies.

Rather than spreading interventions thinly and implementing them for short time-frames, more tangible results can be achieved by concentrating interventions on a smaller target group and allowing greater implementation time.

Related to the above point, programmes that involve implementation by multiple UN agencies typically entail each agency working on particular interventions in separate geographic areas. Coordination should be strengthened so the full range of interventions can be carried out within a single area, so as to generate the full benefits.

Subsidies and other incentives can be effective in the short-term in bringing about behaviour change/encouraging people to participate in different interventions (e.g. installation of

sanitation facilities). But again, it is important to keep long-term sustainability in mind, and to consider the implications when a programme ends and subsidies are removed. Approaches need to be used that are not dependent on external funding and support, and thus sustainable.

Polio vaccination has been the focus of targeted terrorist attacks in recent years. Diverse approaches were used to carry out polio vaccination, notably integration with administration of other vaccines, and mobilization of religious leaders and publications to counter misconceptions about polio vaccination being unIslamic. This shows that, with the right approach, even seemingly insurmountable obstacles – including those with religious sensitivity – can be overcome.

Convergent programming is an effective approach to address needs in different sectors (e.g. health, education, WASH, child protection); by tackling these together at the same time, positive impacts are amplified. As seen in the Polio Plus programme, it can also be an effective way to carry out otherwise challenging interventions.

A number of major issues are faced in relation to treatment of HIV/AIDS: on-going stigma and discrimination, which makes it difficult for people to access services; weak monitoring and surveillance – critical to identify who is affected and ensure they get treatment; lack of opioid substitution treatment (OST) – also critical, given that many of those with HIV are people who inject drugs. Recommendations include establishment of a rights-based approach rooted in law to create an enabling environment for affectees to get treatment; more effective use of community health workers to identify and provide treatment for affectees; and improved coordination of HIV/AIDS response at provincial level.

## **Review Findings**

### *Provision of Health Care in Rural Sindh*

There are several major issues with the healthcare system in rural Sindh including lack of facilities, lack of staff, poor quality of care, and high levels of poverty in the population resulting in financial barriers to access healthcare. A UN project implemented in ten rural districts of Sindh was able to bring about significant improvements in relevant health indicators (antenatal care, deliveries by skilled birth attendants, institutional deliveries, postnatal care) in the intervention districts.

The evaluation report of the project identified a number of factors contributing to its success. It took innovative and holistic approaches to addressing health care issues in rural Sindh: public-private partnerships to improve availability of healthcare services; strengthening community-based and outreach care services; using community networks for advocacy and mobilization (esp. behaviour change); using voucher/incentive schemes to encourage take-up of health services. Its seven components were carefully selected to support national MNCH policies, plans and strategies aimed at reducing maternal, neonatal and child mortality; it was closely aligned to the Sindh Provincial MNCH program and aims, and more broadly to the National Health Policy 2009. This alignment greatly enhanced the project's potential for scale-up and/or for adoption of successful interventions by the government.

Shortage of skilled human resource in primary and secondary health facilities is a perennial problem all across Pakistan and particularly in rural Sindh, but the project interventions



showed that with the right incentives and conditions this can be tackled. Specifically, it showed that public-private partnerships can be an effective way to provide quality MNCH services in areas where these are lacking. By contracting out services, the project was able to overcome constraints such as lack of qualified staff and ensure that facilities operated all day, seven days a week and at only a small mark-up cost. To resolve the issue of insufficient numbers of Lady Health Workers, the project mobilized 'focal families' (community members) to raise awareness in local communities and promote health seeking knowledge and behaviour. Again, focal families could potentially be scaled up as a complement to the LHW programme. However, the evaluation report also stressed that, while creating demand and changing behaviours in the community are critical for bringing women and children to facilities, this has to be matched with health facility up-gradation and 24/7 functionality.

A third major issue tackled by the project was health care financing. A number of innovations were tried in this regard. A voucher scheme enabled people to access health care services. This had a very slow start but had begun to show an impact in terms of changes in poor people's health seeking behaviours through facility use. However, the evaluation noted that the voucher scheme was terminated before the end of the project – had it been allowed to continue it could have produced fuller voucher redemption. A second scheme entailed communities helping themselves: focal families mobilized local people to pool resources and set up an emergency fund for use in, for example, deliveries. The evaluation highlighted the fact that many senior government officials were receptive to the use of these health financing interventions, but said additional financial support was needed to go beyond demonstration activities before scale-up.

The evaluation report also highlighted some shortcomings, with lessons for future such interventions. A number of different UN agencies were involved in implementation, but carried out different interventions in different districts – this meant there was no district where all interventions were carried out. The evaluation noted that a full package of interventions tested simultaneously in one district would have been more effective; moreover, allowing a greater implementation timeframe would have produced more tangible results.

The various factors referred to above – the close alignment of the project with national and provincial health policies and programmes, successful partnership with the private sector to overcome staffing and other constraints hampering healthcare, community mobilization (including through focal families) to change behaviour and promote demand for health services, the innovations in health financing – all mean the project has huge potential for scale-up.

### *Improving Newborn Care*

Agency reports detailed progress made in newborn care: training of community-based health workers in neonatal resuscitation techniques in resource-limited settings; up-gradation of newborn care units at health facilities; training of health sector personnel in essential newborn care. The reports highlighted the addition of chlorhexidine (CHX) (a common antiseptic used to prevent the infection of a baby's freshly cut umbilical cord stump) to Pakistan's national and provincial essential drug lists. Moreover, three pharmaceutical companies had registered to produce CHX locally. This came about because of UN advocacy with the Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan and the Pakistan Pharmaceutical Manufacturers Association. Local production capacity is essential to bring about timely and cost-effective supply of CHX. The UN

was thus able to ensure that the increased demand for CHX would be matched by increased *local* supply.

### *Provision of Access to Safe Drinking Water and Sanitation Facilities*

A UN programme to ensure safe drinking water, improved sanitation and hygiene practices for the most vulnerable and marginalized, focused on rural parts of flood/insecurity affected areas in ten districts and three FATA agencies across the country, was largely successful in achieving its targets. The programme evaluation report identified a number of factors contributing to its success, but also raised some concerns about the long-term sustainability of the initiative.

Among success factors, was the use of both school led total sanitation (SLTS) and community-led total sanitation (CLTS) approaches which helped to sensitize and educate communities resulting in increased demand for sanitation facilities – supported further by the cyclical BCC<sup>2</sup> campaigns. The project provided subsidies for latrine construction; this was a departure from conventional CATS<sup>3</sup> approaches but allowed within PATS<sup>4</sup> as humanitarian assistance in post-disaster/insecurity environment. While the subsidies promoted equity and demand, they could be problematic in the long-run. Subsidies reduce the willingness of other poor families to put their own resources into latrine facility construction, thus acting as a detrimental incentive and creating dependency. The evaluation report suggested reassessing the use of subsidies, and testing other modalities, e.g. providing collective incentives at community level, setting up a revolving credit/contributory fund to be managed by village committees.

The evaluation found the programme had been more effective in stimulating the demand side than the supply side. It recommended highlighting to manufacturers, entrepreneurs and dealers the opportunity for business expansion offered by underserved areas. If interventions can identify and work with manufacturers/dealers to realise the real market potential and opportunity offered by these areas, in the long run this would contribute to ensuring continued supplies and technological innovation.

However, perhaps the biggest risk to long-term sustainability resulted from the implementation approach taken of working with contracted partners rather than through the public sector. This worked well to achieve project targets. While a range of officials from government departments (LGRDD<sup>5</sup>, PHED<sup>6</sup>, Education, Health) helped with selection of villages, identification of target schools and health facilities, the ODF certification process – little progress was made in fostering ownership among public sector agencies either to take over responsibility and/or scale-up interventions. The evaluation report warned that the SLTS component was unlikely to sustain without continued support from district education officers. It recommended piloting PATS implementation with public stakeholders in at least one province, and urged that future such interventions have a clear sustainability strategy, laying out the roles of community and government stakeholders (and obtaining their consent to deliver it).

An unexpected benefit of the programme highlighted in the evaluation report was reducing violence against women. The project experience pointed to a critical link between open

---

<sup>2</sup> behaviour change communication

<sup>3</sup> Community Approach to Total Sanitation

<sup>4</sup> Pakistan Approach to Total Sanitation

<sup>5</sup> Local Government and Rural Development Department

<sup>6</sup> Public Health Engineering Department

defecation and gender violence: access to sanitation facilities in the home meant women did not have to go out in the hours of darkness. This reduced the risk of them being harassed, assaulted or even accused of illicit relations and punished for 'honour' crimes. The report described this as an unplanned yet significant result, and urged that it be overtly incorporated in future project design, specifically in demand creation and behaviour change strategies.

#### *Adolescent and Reproductive Health Services*

In the context of increasing capacity to deliver integrated sexual and reproductive health services, agency reports noted the post-devolution weak capacity of provinces to implement health and population programmes, as well as lack of commitment. Adolescent services and reproductive health (ASRH) were not a priority for government, partly because of lack of clarity on the concept and the services entailed. However, the agency report conceded growing commitment on the part of provincial governments. The report recommended that health and population provision be kept institutionally separate at provincial level, since merger carried the risk of losing focus on family planning and reproductive health. However, programmes could be functionally integrated to reduce duplication and increase effectiveness of service delivery. It also recommended that ASRH programmes be mainstreamed into regular government-led initiatives.

In the context of increasing national capacity to deliver HIV programmes, an agency report stressed that in a conservative social context it was important to use language acceptable to decision-makers. However, it also pointed out that the context was not always as conservative as it seemed: Pakistan was one of the first countries to add 'Transgender' as a third sex to its national identity card.

#### *Polio Eradication*

Targeted attacks on vaccinators and vaccine stations have greatly exacerbated the challenges faced in trying to bring about polio eradication in Pakistan. Agency reports detail a number of innovative approaches being taken to overcome opposition to vaccination. One approach has been to integrate polio vaccination with administration of other vaccines (for measles, pneumonia, meningitis, hepatitis B, DTP and tuberculosis) in order to circumvent polio-specific terrorist attacks. The integrated health package has been effective in increasing polio vaccination coverage despite decreased public support for vaccination. The PolioPlus initiative, described below, is an extension of this 'blanket' approach.

A second key approach has been to engage religious leaders and religious publications. Since the misconceptions about polio vaccination – that it is against Islam, that it can cause infertility – refer to religion, and since religion plays such a critical role in people's lives, it is important that they get reassurance about getting their children vaccinated against polio from respected religious figures and publications.

A third approach taken by governments with UN support was to shift the strategic focus from covered to continuously missed children: to prioritize high-risk union councils and under-served communities. Adding female community mobilizers to the polio workforce allowed better access to women with young children. Other innovative communication techniques used to promote polio vaccination include: a national polio hotline offering female-to-female support

in more than five languages; a storyteller initiative using lady health workers; and printing polio messages on utility bills, which reached over two million households.

### *Convergent Programming for Children*

Polio Plus is an example of convergent programming. Agency reports highlight this approach being taken to addressing the needs of children: by carrying out all the interventions needed by children at the same time in target communities, these reinforce each other and positive impacts are amplified. The Polio Plus programme addresses the need for water, sanitation, nutrition and MNCH services alongside polio vaccination – thus increasing acceptance of polio vaccination and tackling critical underlying determinants of the continuing circulation of the wild poliovirus.

A second example of convergent programming described in agency reports is a project to promote child rights in cotton farming. It addresses needs for child protection, education, health and WASH. Multisectoral interventions - designed so that those in one sector supplemented those in others – were implemented in a number of districts of Balochistan, Punjab and Sindh. For example, by bringing clean drinking water closer to people's homes, the project eliminated the need for girls to fetch water, thus increasing their chances of going to school. At the same time, schools were supported to be more child-friendly through the introduction of CF teaching methods, and through provision of basic health services. Similarly, improved water and sanitation facilities at community level reduced the burden of disease and improved work productivity, while vocational training, small loans and business development opportunities, especially for women, helped boost family incomes.

### *Tackling HIV and AIDS*

Agency reports highlighted a number of challenges faced in relation to tackling HIV and AIDS, and made recommendations to help overcome these. Devolution has shifted responsibility for policy-making, finances, planning and implementation to the provinces, but there is still a need to bring together multiple government stakeholders to address the HIV response. The Ministry of Health Services Regulation and Coordination at national level needs to develop systems for a more effective role in the area of coordination among provinces as well as provision of normative guidance to the provinces.

Institutionalizing partnerships between emerging community groups, civil society and the public sector is necessary to effectively deliver HIV/AIDS services. There is a need to strengthen the role of community health workers and CSOs to mobilise communities, increase demand for services, and facilitate adherence and compliance. Agonist opioid substitution treatment (OST) can help to stabilise HIV patients, a significant proportion of whom are people who inject drugs (PWID). The absence of OST in Pakistan has been identified by leading health practitioners as one of the main barriers to uptake of and adherence to HIV treatment among HIV positive PWID. Introduction and expansion of OST is therefore critical, not only to treat the large numbers of opioid dependent individuals in Pakistan, but also to prevent wider transmission of HIV and other blood-borne viruses.

A third major issue featured in agency reports is the on-going stigma and discrimination around HIV/AIDS. In healthcare and social settings this is a major barrier to testing and treatment uptake, especially for key population groups at higher risk of HIV (MSM, TGs, sex workers and

their clients, people who inject drugs). The reports note that systemic and governance management barriers have to be overcome to bring about the required massive increase in coverage, continuity and effectiveness of HIV service provision. In a socially conservative culture with an epidemic concentrated among marginalized and criminalised populations, a rights-based approach is critical so that those most in need are able to access services. The reports recommend that legislation be developed to create a conducive environment. In this regard, strategic partnerships should be developed with the Ministry of Human Rights, Law and Justice to help promote an enabling environment.

Finally, agency reports point to the weak monitoring of HIV/AIDS in the population, noting that at present it is difficult to even measure progress as no surveillance has been conducted since 2011. There is a need for a massive scale-up in HIV testing of key population groups so that more people become aware of their status and can access treatment.

## **Strategic Priority Area 2:**

### **Inclusive Economic Growth through the Development of Sustainable Livelihoods**

## 2.1 SPA2: Progress Assessment

Economic growth in Pakistan has stalled in recent years, but even when growth was high in the past decade, this did not lead to significant improvements in human development. It shows the need for inclusive economic growth strategies. Critical requirements are a skilled, educated and health workforce; labour force participation – particularly of women and other disadvantaged groups - in the development of key economic sectors; increased industrial development (based on clean production and sustainable energy) and trade. OPII lays out an agenda to address the challenges to economic growth in Pakistan, one which stresses inclusiveness and environmental sustainability.

**Outcome 2.1 – Creation of employment opportunities and decent work through industry, construction, services, vocational/skill training, agricultural and cultural development, as well as promoting youth employment and public-private partnerships**

*Output 2.1.1 Policies and programmes to enable inclusive growth and improve livelihood and economic opportunities for the most vulnerable developed and implemented with a particular focus on agriculture, culture and post-crisis recovery.*

*Output 2.1.2 Marginalized and excluded communities enjoy equitable access to advanced vocational and entrepreneurship skills training under a revamped and responsive TVET system*

*Output 2.1.3 Women and young people have increased access to skills, training and financial assets necessary to participate more fully in the formal economy*

The UN provided technical support for the preparation of the national 2013 MDGs Report and four provincial MDG reports. Support was also given to prioritize goals and investments and prepare provincial MDG Acceleration Frameworks (MAF) for the last two years of the MDGs. UN advocacy contributed to the Planning Commission adopting the Multi-Dimensional Poverty Index as an official poverty measure - a more effective tool for informing public policy and resource allocation. The UN promoted policy debate on key development challenges through launch of a quarterly publication *Development Advocate Pakistan*, and by leading consultations on the post-2015 agenda and the role of capacity and institutions in achievement of the SDGs.

UN initiatives to promote agriculture-based livelihoods featured policy level support as well as direct on-ground assistance to communities. With regard to policies, the Pakistan Agricultural Research Council (PARC) was assisted to prepare a long-term agricultural development framework to boost growth and create more jobs. The KP and Balochistan Governments were similarly helped to prepare provincial agriculture policies and strategies. 'On ground' initiatives included: a three-year livelihoods project in Sindh aimed at restoring and protecting rural livelihoods and empowering poor and vulnerable peasants; analysis of 38 value chains with recommendations for improvement, e.g. increased use of cardboard boxes in packing produce; establishment of farmer field schools, e.g. on wheat farming, livestock production; wool shearing skills development; and capacity building of Farmers' Market Collectives.



To promote economic opportunities through culture, the UN worked with the Sindh Government to prepare a masterplan for Moenjodaro aimed at ensuring sustainable conservation and development of the site and identifying opportunities for tourism and income generation. Similar work was carried out with the Balochistan Directorate of Culture to safeguard the province's cultural heritage.

Under output 2.1.2, a major focus of UN efforts to 'revamp' the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system in Pakistan was on incorporating Know About Business (KAB) into vocational training curricula. UN support helped to mainstream KAB into curricula in Punjab and Sindh, including training of staff from rural and urban institutes. The Sindh and Punjab TEVTAs and Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTTC) were given additional support to improve the relevance, quality and outreach of their vocational training programmes.

Projects in Sindh and Punjab included empowering vulnerable groups through education, employment and training (EET) and promoting gender equality for decent employment (GE4DE). Over 6,000 people across all four provinces – the majority of them women - received vocational training, with many going on to find employment or set up their own enterprises. The UN helped raise awareness among women, notably home-based workers (HBWs) of their labour rights. Some 18,000 informal HBWs were supported through skills development, guidance on income generation opportunities and accessing social security/health benefits, and assistance through micro-credit schemes – enabling them to participate more fully in the formal economy. Critical analysis by the UN of budgetary allocations and expenditures in national and provincial budgets, specifically with regard to the informal sector, gender issues and HBWs was a further step towards achieving gender equality.

All refugees face challenges in finding sources of livelihood, but this is particularly difficult for those in rural areas and for women. Three livelihood support projects by the UN, working with certified vocational training providers, helped improve marketable skills among these groups. Following the 2014 mass displacement of people from North Waziristan Agency, the UN collaborated with the Provincial DMA to set up an Emergency Employment Information Centre in Bannu; those registered at the centre were supported to find employment and generate income through asset replenishment and cash for work schemes.

**Outcome 2.2 – Industrial development, both urban and rural, emphasizing SME/SMI development, women's participation, clean development and sustainable energy supply and use at affordable cost**

*Output 2.2.1 Policies and programmes to promote the growth of a sustainable and inclusive SME/SMI sector formulated and implemented*

*Output 2.2.2 Clean production strategies – including waste management and climate change mitigation measures – promoted and adopted in priority industrial sectors*

*Output 2.2.3 Targeted initiatives to enhance production and use of low-cost sustainable energy solutions, particularly among poor households, piloted at community and national levels*

In relation to output 2.2.1, the UN helped promote the growth of sustainable and inclusive small and medium enterprises (SMEs) and industries (SMIs) through identification and formulation of investment opportunities in various sectors, e.g. leather. Business incubation centres in nine

public sector universities were strengthened; these provide on the spot diagnoses and treatment for business problems, significantly reducing the failure rate of SMEs in the early stages of development. The UN also provided capacity building support to the SME Development Authority (SMEDA) and other relevant public and private sector institutions, e.g. in design and implementation of SME finance schemes, technological upgrading.

Under joint output 2.2.2, UN efforts to promote clean production were focused on supporting Pakistan to comply with its obligations under the Montreal Protocol to phase out release of ozone depleting substances (hydrochlorofluorocarbons or HCFCs). As well as assisting the Climate Change Division's Ozone Cell, the UN provided technical guidance to manufacturing companies in the refrigeration sector in targeted regions to help them become more efficient and environmentally friendly. Launch of the Sustainable Consumption and Production (SCP) Centre helped mainstream SCP within environmental, economic and broader sustainable development planning and policies. The UN supported implementation of the National Climate Change Policy at 15 sites of critically threatened ecosystems across the country through an integrated approach to biodiversity conservation and livelihoods promotion.

In relation to output 2.2.3, the UN carried out a number of initiatives to promote clean energy use. One project promotes the use of biomass gasification technologies for power generation and for thermal applications, thereby reducing reliance on the national grid. The project supports multiple pilot schemes in Punjab. The UN's Cleantech programme focused on various aspects of clean energy such as renewable energy and energy efficiency. It supported 28 SMEs through, for example, training and access to investors, and awarded substantial prizes to the winners. At community level, the UN helped install solar lights, solar water pumps and solar geysers in a district in KP and a district hospital in e Balochistan. Women in target areas of KP – previously with no power at all - reported a significant improvement in their lives, e.g. no longer having to spend hours searching for water. The UN also supported the government in carrying out nationwide consultations for a situation assessment and subsequent road map development for sustainable energy solutions in Pakistan.

### **Outcome 2.3 – Equitable and fair trade promotion enhanced**

#### ***Output 2.3.1 Policies and support mechanisms for inclusive trade and development in place***

#### ***Output 2.3.2 Women are better able to participate in and benefit from engagement with the global trade system***

The UN carried out a number of initiatives to promote trade and development and help Pakistan's economy integrate equitably in the global economy. The Trade and Transport Facilitation Unit of the Ministry of Commerce was supported with policy recommendations which strengthened regional connectivity and integrated border check posts and custom house agents. The UN managed the Trade Related Technical Assistance II programme in Pakistan. Technical support improved service delivery and sector-specific value chain development.

Quality control was one of the main areas in which the UN provided support. Extensive interventions in the quality regime resulted in the establishment of the Pakistan National Accreditation Council, the accreditation of 40 testing and 6 metrology labs, the establishment of an internationally recognized agency (National Physical and Standards Laboratory) and of a national framework for SPS management. Very significant was UN technical assistance to the

Marine Fishery Department to safeguard Sanitary and Phytosanitary (SPS) compliance along the supply chain, resulting in a seven-year ban on Pakistani fish exports to the EU being lifted and the resumption of fish supplies to the EU in 2013. In other sectors, too, the UN helped the government establish essential links to qualified buyers, leading to direct export of Pakistani goods (e.g. mangoes, mandarin kinnows) to high-end markets in Europe, South Asia and China.

Negligible evidence was found of UN efforts in relation to joint output 2.3.2, to ensure women are better able to participate in and benefit from engagement with the global trade system.

## **Outcome 2.4 – Key causes and consequences of population growth addressed**

### ***Output 2.4.1 Key decision-makers are able to conduct demographic research and utilise data in the formulation of economic and labour policies***

The UN conducted a number of studies on population-related issues. A mapping study assessed provincial capacity to integrate population into policies and plans, while additional studies resulted in two key recommendations: to increase knowledge of population issues through civil servant trainings, and to include population trends in provincial policies and plans. The UN subsequently provided technical assistance for drafting of the Sindh and KP population policies. A study on the state of internal migration and urbanization in Sindh and Balochistan looked at the impact of these, e.g. on employment: the findings will support evidence-based policy making. The UN also supported an international conference in 2014 with representation from South Asia and regional countries focused on achievement of MDGs 4, 5 and 6. The conference agreed to share best practices for reduction of population growth rate as well as maternal mortality and infant mortality rates.

In order to build capacity for demographic research, the UN trained 52 staff members of the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) on GIS technology and tools. Over 60 percent of urban areas in Pakistan have been digitized and PBS has the capacity to digitize the entire country. This capacity building will be particularly useful in conduct of the next population and housing census. The UN also carried out assessments of PBS staff capacity to collect gender disaggregated data – this will help PBS develop a national coordination mechanism for collection of such data. At provincial level, demographers in KP, Punjab and Sindh Population Welfare Departments were trained in collecting, compiling, analysing and reporting on population data – enabling them to prepare and upgrade district level socioeconomic and demographic data.

## 2.2 SPA2: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*The meta-review examined evaluation reports related to a number of programmes focused on livelihood restoration and disaster risk reduction: one had the additional focus of empowering vulnerable peasants. It also looked at reports relating to UN interventions to promote industrial development.*

When promoting livelihood restoration for communities traditionally engaged in agriculture (farming), in the short-term (relief and early recovery phases) it could be more effective to support income generation through livestock. Agriculture is dependent on many factors outside the control of a programme: livestock production could be a more 'reliable' approach to helping affected families generate income.

In the long-term (in recovery and reconstruction/rehabilitation phases) support for agriculture will be needed for farming communities. Rather than spread interventions thinly over a large population, it could be more effective to concentrate larger quantities of aid on smaller target groups.

Many of the livelihood restoration programmes undertaken to date under OPII entail a wide range of different interventions. A more effective approach could be to carry out fewer interventions with a smaller number of implementing partners.

Livelihood restoration is not something that can be brought about quickly: support for livelihood restoration needs to reflect this and be provided for a significant period of time.

Consideration should be given to the full gamut of needs of rights holders, and interventions should aim to be holistic – addressing all aspects. For example, interventions to develop skills for handicraft production (as a source of alternative livelihoods for women) should be accompanied by training and support to access markets.

Time, resources and effort need to be put into ensuring coordination of large-scale programmes with multiple interventions and/or involvement of multiple UN agencies and implementing partners. A programme-wide M&E system should be developed – with (as far as possible) standardized indicators even for different types of interventions – rather than individual M&E systems for each UN agency/each intervention.

Having some sort of institutional set-up at district level can greatly facilitate stakeholder engagement, provide opportunities to forge strong partnerships with government agencies and others, and help ensure sustainability of programme interventions.

Opportunities for promotion of gender equality should be actively identified and implemented.

Interventions to promote industrial development are most effective when they involve close collaboration between government, the private sector and the UN.

Pakistan's export quality regime has strengthened greatly over the past decade, and government support and income generation by laboratories augur well for sustainability.

However, private sector involvement should be encouraged to foster competition and reduce costs, and equal attention should be paid to quality control for the domestic market.

Interventions to promote environmental sustainability/technological upgradation as part of industrial development should also pay attention to socioeconomic impacts, notably potential loss of livelihood for some people. Alternative sources of employment should be developed in parallel so that both people and the environment benefit.

## **Review Findings**

The overwhelming majority of livelihood interventions assessed as part of the meta-review focused on livelihood restoration in the context of disaster recovery and disaster risk reduction. Livelihood restoration/promotion through agriculture featured prominently in these. There were also agency reports focused on industrial development.

### *Livelihood Restoration and Disaster Risk Reduction in Sindh*

A UN project in two flood affected districts of Sindh (Jacobabad and Kashmore) carried out a wide range of interventions to promote livelihood recovery. These included provision of agricultural inputs (e.g. seeds, fertilizer); support for vegetable gardening, poultry and livestock production; and restoration of physical infrastructure (e.g. water courses) through cash for work schemes. The project had significant achievements: it promoted diversification of livelihoods (more men involved in non-farming agriculture or construction, more women in sale of handicrafts); the drop in food consumption levels was arrested, and beneficiaries reported higher perceptions of food security than non-beneficiaries; diversification in crop choice, with more beneficiaries growing sunflower; and marked increase in livestock ownership, particularly in the poorest quintile. Furthermore, over 80% of respondents in the evaluation report said they could cope with future disasters in a better manner.

In a number of respects, however, there was not much difference between beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries: a greater share of non-beneficiaries had also shifted to non-farming livelihoods; and while more non-beneficiaries reported being indebted, levels of debt were higher among beneficiaries. The similarities in some outcomes for beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries could be attributed to support being provided by other aid agencies/development partners. However, another factor was unrealistic expectations. The evaluation report noted that expecting drastic changes in food security, wealth status, incomes, livelihoods, and disaster risk mitigation from such small support packages is not realistic. Such change requires a lot more investment, effort and innovation; the lesson for future programs was to be conservative when envisaging impact and outcomes.

As well as lowering expectations, the evaluation report identified a number of changes that could have made the project more effective. Firstly, it said inputs provided to each affected household should constitute a bigger package and preferably include a combination of various packages. Noting that in disaster recovery projects, the natural inclination and humanitarian need is to reach the most number of affected people, it said this approach should be applied to emergency relief and early recovery interventions, while for longer term and more permanent recovery the focus should be to cover a smaller population with a greater share of aid.

Secondly, agricultural support is a very complex undertaking which is dependent upon several external factors beyond the control of implementing agencies. The evaluation report suggested that in cases where the population was significantly dependent on farming, livestock support would be a more practical option for short-term assistance than providing agricultural inputs. Enterprise grants and alternative livelihood interventions would also be effective. For a population primarily associated with small-scale farming, more comprehensive agricultural support packages needed to be designed spanning a longer duration rather than providing limited agricultural inputs such as seed and fertilizers for one acre of land in only one season.

Thirdly, support as a whole needed to be of longer duration. There was nearly uniform consensus among survey respondents (99.7%) that they required further assistance in order to complete the recovery process. For both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries, cash and direct inputs were identified as the more prominent types of assistance required.

Fourthly, the evaluation report suggested implementation could have been more efficient with perhaps fewer partners at the grassroots level and with fewer types of interventions (the programme under review had a total of over 25 different types of interventions). It recommended that in future such programmes, where the overall objective of various projects and interventions is largely similar, standardization should be used with a common set of impact and outcome indicators – though targets could of course vary according to the size and scope of the interventions.

#### *Livelihood Restoration and Empowerment of Peasants/Vulnerable Farmers in Sindh*

Another livelihood-focused project in Sindh, also addressed post-flood recovery – in addition, it sought to empower local farmers and peasants, many of whom were dependent on feudal and landholding and farming systems. As such, alongside restoring farm production capacities and off-farm income-generating activities, it aimed to provide vulnerable peasants with access to social security schemes and to microfinance, as well as to empower peasant organizations.

The programme evaluation report noted progress made in relation to all the main intervention areas: economic security of rural communities (e.g. provision of integrated homestead gardening packages to 500 HBW *hari* farmers), access to microfinance, access to social security; vocational training; and formation of peasant organizations. But it highlighted a number of issues faced in implementation. Notable among these was poor coordination between the three UN agencies involved in the programme. It noted that there was no single monitoring and evaluation framework for the programme: each agency used its own M&E framework. It recommended that a project-wide M&E system be developed, and far more time, resources and effort be put into coordination.

The evaluation report stated that, even if fully implemented, a number of project activities would not be fully effective unless they were supplemented by additional interventions. For example, vocational training needed to be backed up with on-going mentoring support. Women who had registered for social security but were not getting assistance needed help with grievance redressal. To ensure success in alternative livelihoods such as handicraft production, people needed guidance on business and market opportunities. Linked to this, the report raised concerns about the sustainability of some interventions; it highlighted the fact that this depended greatly on individual UN agencies and the strategies and institutional arrangements

they had put in place for this. Again, this pointed to the need for greater coordination and a programme-wide approach.

One of the key successes of the programme identified in the evaluation report was the formation of District Coordination Committees (DCC) bringing together multiple local stakeholders. The report said DCCs had enhanced stakeholder involvement, and provided a unique opportunity to forge strong partnerships with government agencies and others, and ensure sustainability of project results.

The evaluation report lauded the strong gender focus of the programme. As well as engaging women in vocational training and livelihood support (e.g. kitchen gardening, poultry rearing, handicrafts production) the programme was committed to ensuring women's participation at every level and in every forum: village disaster management committees, training and awareness raising programmes, HBW groups, farmers field schools, and so on. Moreover the programme planned to ensure village disaster management plans were gender-sensitive.

#### *Gender Equality in Livelihood Support Interventions*

The above point about a strong focus on gender quality considerations and inclusion of marginalized groups such as women-headed households was also made in the relevant agency reports. These noted that poultry and vegetable seed packages were specifically distributed among women beneficiaries to help them set up home-based provision for food/income generation. While all activities sought to include both men and women, a number of women-specific activities were implemented, e.g. on dairy production, wool processing and marketing and homestead gardening and poultry rearing just described. An example of progress made through such interventions was a 20-25 percent increase in the incomes of at least 5,500 women in Balochistan.

#### *Quality Export Regime and Industrial Development*

Just over a decade ago, there were almost no structures and processes in place to ensure quality of goods produced in Pakistan, specifically exports. A rigorous quality regime is essential for winning orders and access to international markets. The UN has played a significant role in bringing Pakistan to the point where a quality regime is now largely in place.

Agency reports identify a number of critical factors contributing to this success: a) full commitment and support from the Government of Pakistan, and from the partner organizations involved; b) continuity of the relevant UN team in Pakistan; and c) the UN's ability to bring in national and international experts. Commitment on the part of government has sustained, as evident from the fact that funding of the quality regime has shifted from project-based PC-1s to regular budget allocations. Laboratories are also generating their own income through testing, calibration, etc. and two-thirds of this revenue is invested back in the laboratories – auguring well for sustainability.

While much has been achieved there is scope for improvement. The quality regime could be further strengthened by involving the private sector: commercializing testing beyond government laboratories would introduce more competition, expand coverage and bring down costs for exporters. Secondly, the progress made on the export front has not been matched in relation to the domestic market, particularly food safety control and enforcement.



Agency reports note that in other UN initiatives to promote industrial development, e.g. with tanneries, wool producers, very positive results were seen when there was a strong alliance between government, the private sector and the UN, working together towards common and clear objectives. UN engagement with clusters of industries/enterprises (e.g. leather tanneries in Kasur and Sialkot) – as opposed to individual enterprises - was also identified as contributing to effectiveness of interventions.

Many UN supported interventions for industrial development feature ‘cleaner production’ or ‘greening of industry’ as a cross-cutting theme. Indeed, agency reports note that many newly initiated and pilot projects deal directly with environmental issues. However, they also point out that in some cases, in the drive for technology up-gradation and environmental sustainability socioeconomic effects have been overlooked. This is particularly where interventions lead to reduced labour needs – seen, for example, in the introduction of fat extraction plants in the leather industry. The reports stress that, when a practise or processing unit is being phased out, opportunities for alternative employment should be developed in parallel.

### **Strategic Priority Area 3:**

## **Increased National Resilience to Disasters, Crises and External Shocks**

### 3.1 SPA3: Progress Assessment

Pakistan is a high risk country for natural disasters such as floods and droughts – a problem made worse by the impact of climate change. In recent years it has also frequently been hit by manmade disasters such as conflict. It is the poor and vulnerable who are disproportionately affected in such situations. OPII calls for enhanced policies, planning and capacity for all aspects of disaster management: preparedness, relief, recovery and reconstruction. As well as engaging with national, provincial and district level DRM bodies, OPII places emphasis on working with communities. OPII also stresses the importance of environmental sustainability, climate change adaptation and mitigation, and calls for action on drugs trafficking and human trafficking.

#### **Outcome 3.1 – National, provincial and district capacities to prevent, assess, reduce and manage risks are developed**

*Output 3.1.1 All key disaster management institutions establish effective risk assessment, hazard mapping, coordination and oversight mechanisms at federal, provincial and district levels addressing the concerns of vulnerable population*

*Output 3.1.2 PDMAs, DDMA's and service providers develop contingency plans that respond to community and individual level vulnerabilities*

*Output 3.1.3 DMAs and other institutions including line departments at national, provincial and district levels, are better prepared and able to respond to and reduce risk*

*Output 3.1.4 Community-based mitigation and preparedness programmes established and function effectively*

In relation to output 3.1.1, UN efforts in collaboration with the Pakistan Meteorological Department (PMD), DMAs and others resulted in improved flood management and early warning systems. The Global Satellite Mapping of Precipitation (GSMAP) and the Indus Integrated Flood Analysis System (Indus-IFAS) increased flood early warning lead time by one day, allowing authorities and communities more time to prepare for and evacuate prior to floods. New early warning systems for community-level hazards were piloted; these included procedures to improve dissemination of life-saving information through local radio stations and SMS. Flood hazard maps were developed for 32 districts, covering approximately 53 million households. These maps led to improved coordination between agencies and reduced human casualties and damage in the 2014 floods. The PMD's capacity to monitor and provide early warning of destructive weather patterns was further built through installation and training in use of sensors for ten automatic weather stations.

Under output 3.1.2, the UN helped the NDMA to set up the Network of Disaster Management Practitioners Implementation Unit, to promote coordination with provincial and district disaster management institutions. District level government officials and humanitarian counterparts in Sindh, KP and Islamabad were trained in Camp Coordination and Camp Management (CCCM), and participants registered in a roster to facilitate deployment of trained individuals in the event of an emergency. The UN worked with authorities to improve disaster

preparedness and response mechanisms in three multi-hazard districts (D.I. Khan, Khyber Agency and D.G. Khan), with focus on reducing agriculture sector vulnerabilities to ensure food security and protect livelihoods. Two districts of Balochistan (Jaffarabad and Naseerabad) saw the UN carry out multi-hazard vulnerability assessments to develop hazard and risk atlas maps. A Multi-Hazard Vulnerability and Risk Assessment exercise, launched in Sindh in 2014, will entail sharing of methodologies, guidelines and atlases and training of key stakeholders such as government officials and humanitarian partners. The aim is for the hazards identified in the atlas to be taken into consideration in development planning.

In relation to output 3.1.3, the UN worked extensively with government to align disaster resilience programmes with national development priorities. Education and health are key sectors for integration of DRR. The UN engaged with health departments, advocating for inclusion of DRR in health sector plans and for the integration of district information management systems for health and disaster response. A school and hospital safety programme was designed in close collaboration with the Ministries of Health and Education to investigate and produce disaster resilient shelters and public infrastructure. UN efforts to promote gender concerns in DRR planning led to gender being mainstreamed in the 2014 Balochistan Monsoon Contingency Plan and DRR Plan and to development of the NDMA's National Strategic Gender and Child Cell Framework and Work Plan (2014-17), which focuses on gender in disaster responses.

The UN spearheaded training platforms and developed a bilingual manual on DRR to strengthen the institutional capacities of federal, provincial, district and local disaster risk management committees for policy-making, planning and development. Training of 845 officials in Punjab, KP and Balochistan in the School Safety Plan of Action focused on DRR, and specifically child-centred DRR. The UN also supported the inclusion of DRR in some teacher training programmes.

Under output 3.1.4, measures to prepare communities for disasters included putting up warehouses in 21 districts to stockpile food and supplies for use in emergencies, and training of seven at-risk communities in DRR, preparedness, mitigation and management. Almost a thousand people, the vast majority women, were trained and equipped to provide additional CBDRR trainings. The UN and local governments constructed seven CBDRR centres, both to serve as training locations and as evacuation points in the event of a disaster.

In the wake of the 2014 floods, the UN assisted many communities to 'build back better' using DRR construction methods: 6,000 technical trainings on safer shelter construction by adapting local building methods reached approximately 125,000 community members, nearly 34,000 of them women. Capacity building elements were included in other interventions as well, e.g. training people in seed production and protection, development of water reservoirs. Support was also provided to the Balochistan Forestry and Wildlife Department to carry out rehabilitation of forest lands.

### **Outcome 3.2 – Vulnerable populations benefit from improved sustainable environmental management practices, including climate change mitigation and adaptation**

#### ***Output 3.2.1 Policies and programmes for integrated natural resource management and climate change adaptation and mitigation developed and implemented at national, provincial and community levels***

*Output 3.2.2 Key institutions at provincial and district level design and implement (community-based) integrated natural resource management strategies in environmentally fragile eco-systems*

*Output 3.2.3 Knowledge and advocacy platform on trans-boundary water issues and best practices for integrated water resource management established*

Under joint output 3.2.1, the UN piloted a number of interventions at community level to mitigate the effects of climate change. These included use of improved heating and cooking methods (cutting wood consumption) and distribution of solar lamps (reducing CO2 emissions). In target areas of Chitral and Gilgit the UN made community members (half of them women) aware of glacial lake outburst floods (GLOF) related hazards and helped set up early warning systems, thereby reducing climate change risks for communities.

In relation to output 3.2.2, the UN contributed to conservation work in the wetlands and in juniper forests. In Balochistan UN support to local villages in sustainable land management, aimed at combating desertification and drought, led to the conversion of an impressive 8,000 hectares of semi-desert land into productive farmland, including 2,000 hectares of pasture. A local desert plant nursery with up to 200,000 seedlings provided vital planting material for soil protection.

The UN worked to revive the international 'Man and Biosphere Programme' in Pakistan after a long dormancy. In collaboration with the Pakistan Science Foundation, the UN organized a meeting of the South and Central Asia Man and Biosphere Network, focusing on the impact of climate change on natural ecosystems and bringing together stakeholders from government, the UN, academia and environmentalists.

Under output 3.2.3, support was to be given for the establishment of clean production centres for water management in select industries and a web-based portal set up for exchange of data between India and Pakistan on trans-boundary water issues. Neither has been done.

**Outcome 3.3 – Vulnerable populations benefit from improved prevention, risk reduction and response (mitigation) and are assisted to reach development goals including MDG targets**

*Output 3.3.1 Comprehensive plans are in place to provide the most vulnerable populations with reliable, comprehensive information and options to cope with the effects of climate change*

*Output 3.3.2 Right holders including vulnerable children and women, are increasingly resilient with improved capacity to assess, mitigate and respond to disasters*

*Output 3.3.3 Crisis affected communities have access to training, entrepreneurship, livelihood opportunities and community infrastructure during early recovery and rehabilitation*

Following the 2014 security operations in North Waziristan Agency (NWA) and KP, large numbers (around 1.4 million) of temporarily displaced persons (TDPs) were in need of assistance. The UN provided a multi-sector humanitarian response spanning health, nutrition, water and sanitation, education and child protection, and particularly targeting disadvantaged women and children. Grievance desks and assessments of the most vulnerable families (followed by support to women household heads to get CNICs) helped ensure their inclusion in government registration processes. Emergency family kits were distributed.

Under output 3.3.3, the UN helped form 670 community organizations to support livelihood and DRR activities through the modality of cash for work, thereby helping families recover in the wake of disasters such as floods and drought. Seven livelihood recovery appraisals were conducted by the UN in five districts of Punjab and two of Balochistan, and guidelines developed for mainstreaming gender into livestock management as well as community preparedness and recovery manuals. UN support played a critical role in the safe rehabilitation of damaged infrastructure such as bunds, water courses, dams and roads in vulnerable districts of Sindh and KP.

As the security situation improved and families were able to move back to NWA in 2014, the UN supported the return process through provision of food items (e.g. wheat, vegetables, milk) restoration of agriculture-based livelihoods and the protection of livestock. Winter and monsoon crop production inputs, livestock and poultry packages (e.g. feed, vaccines, feeding and milking kits and basic shelter) helped many families restore livelihoods and obtain higher yields. Almost 50,000 households in Bannu, Karak and Lakki Marwat received such support.

### **Outcome 3.4 – Country policies, plans and institutions are enabled to prevent and manage narcotics trafficking-related challenges**

#### ***Output 3.4.1 Relevant institutions establish and maintain central disaggregated database for the exchange of information on cross-border issues***

The UN's approach to tackling narcotics trafficking focused on building capacities of law enforcement agencies (LEAs) and on promoting collaboration between Pakistan and its neighbours. Core training and specialist training curriculum modules were developed for LEAs. Numerous specialised trainings as well as equipment were provided to a range of LEAs, including provincial police departments, the Anti-Narcotics Force (ANF), Pakistan customs and the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA). ANF checkpoints and offices were refurbished and equipment such as vehicles, night vision goggles and bulletproof vests supplied. The Triangular Initiative (TI) between Pakistan, Afghanistan and Iran was supported by the UN through technical support for Pakistani delegates and facilitation of TI meetings. The UN organized four Integrated Border Management (IBM) workshops for officers from Pakistan and Afghanistan.

In 2014 the UN, in collaboration with the Ministry of Interior and Narcotics Control, released the findings of a survey on drug use in Pakistan. Key among these are that 6.7 million people used drugs in the preceding year, 4.25 million were dependent on drugs, the most common drug used was cannabis, and users are predominantly male. The findings will form the baseline for planning and design of drug prevention and treatment programmes in Pakistan.

To tackle human trafficking, the UN conducted a pioneering public awareness campaign covering trafficking and points of entry and exit, which targeted specific provinces. In addition the UN held regional meetings on trafficking and migrant smuggling, leading to sharing of information between Pakistan, Iran, Afghanistan and Turkey. Two reports were published by the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) in 2014 on human trafficking and migrant smuggling in Pakistan, trends and impact. This research is designed to support law enforcement agencies in tackling the issue.

## 3.2 SPA3: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*The meta-review looked at a range of programme reports, covering a number of issues: environmental data, risks from glacier lake outburst floods, use of energy efficient technologies, and narcotics trafficking.*

Investment in research and conduct of baseline assessments (as stand-alone projects) *prior* to programme design can help ensure effectiveness.

It is important to involve local communities in interventions to benefit them, and to draw on local knowledge and experience when deciding on the best approach. In the case of GLOF, for example, installing engineering structures in downstream locations identified by local people, can lead to a greater sense of security for them than putting in upstream structures or trying to drain lakes with potential for GLOF.

It is important to adapt interventions to suit local needs and tastes and to fit in with local norms and constraints. In provision of energy efficient cookers, for example, local preferences and suitability of cookers for preparing local dishes (cuisine) should be taken into consideration.

Engagement with local (including district), provincial and national stakeholders can facilitate programme implementation and help ensure sustainability of interventions.

Highlighting direct and indirect (less obvious) benefits of different interventions can help win over communities and encourage them to use/adopt them. Using 'clean' heating technology, for example, reduces use of wood fuel and emission of greenhouse gases, but also means less smoke in people's homes and improved health outcomes. For women, in particular, there can often be potential for both direct and indirect (e.g. empowerment, enhanced status) benefits.

The use of subsidies and incentives can be effective in the short-term in achieving project targets. But to ensure sustainability, approaches should be sought that are not wholly dependent on programme funding/support and that can be maintained when the programme ends.

There is always scope for regional learning – particularly in relation to climate change challenges which are transnational and being faced by many other countries in the region. Opportunities for learning from other countries' experiences should be actively explored and availed. Specifically, Pakistan can learn from Nepal and Bhutan in relation to GLOF.

Potential for scale-up of successful approaches/interventions should be availed. The approach taken to reducing risks and vulnerability to GLOF, for example, was very successful and has potential for both geographic and thematic scale-up (the same approach could be applied for other hazards, and even for a multi-hazard system).

Undertaking diverse interventions (with related objectives) under a single programme rather than as separate projects can greatly enhance coordination and efficiency. However, it is important to ensure that one programme does actually operate as that – not as stand-alone projects in practice under the label of one programme.

## Review Findings

The meta-review looked at a number of evaluation reports for projects under SPA3 which: improved collection and analysis of environmental data in Pakistan; addressed the risk of Glacier Lake Outburst Floods (GLOF); sought to promote use of clean technologies and energy efficiency in northern Pakistan; and (in relation to outcome 3.4) sought to promote the rule of law and public health. It should be noted that disaster risk reduction was also a major component of a number of UN programmes seeking to restore/promote livelihoods (and food security). The stress on DRR alongside livelihood restoration reflects the negative impact of disasters on people's sources of livelihood and recognition of the need to mitigate against this.

### *Environmental Data*

Data on the environment is a fundamental requirement for understanding the impact and risks posed by climate change, and designing interventions to address these. The state of environmental data in Pakistan is traditionally poor, with a host of organizations involved in collecting, compiling and publishing data leading to issues of incomplete data, inaccessible data, poor quality and lack of coordination between agencies. A UN project sought to address this by establishing a sustainable network of relevant organizations equipped with environmental information technology and tools, and sharing common data infrastructure to facilitate effective management of environment related information in Pakistan.

The project evaluation report noted the challenges faced as a result of devolution and the disbanding of the federal Ministry of Environment. It listed several major achievements of the project: a comprehensive report on the current situation of environmental data in Pakistan; finalization of datasets, indicators and indices for monitoring the state of the environment; a National Environmental Information Management System (NEIMS); and strengthening of capacities of nodal agencies. However, the report highlighted the fact that the institutional and technical framework for NEIMS had not been notified by the government, and hence the system was not functional. It described the fact that NEIMS had been designed on the basis of global and regional practices for environmental data as its biggest strength.

### *Reduction of Risks from Glacier Lake Outburst Floods*

A major risk faced in northern Pakistan is Glacier Lake Outburst Floods (GLOF). Pakistan has the largest volume of glaciers outside the poles, but faces a critical gap in baseline scientific knowledge of glaciers and glacial lakes. A UN project to reduce risks and vulnerabilities from GLOF sought to build public sector capacity to understand and address GLOF risks and to enable vulnerable communities to adapt to growing climate change pressures. Various activities were carried out under the project, including construction of 'Climate Change Adaptation Structures' in pilot areas. These engineering structures were aimed at reduction of vulnerabilities of the exposed communities, based on a participatory process in which communities indicated – drawing on local knowledge – the most vulnerable locations along the river alignment for flash floods. The project thus chose to target mitigation of flood hazard downstream, close to the communities, instead of mitigation at source through drainage of the hazardous glacial lakes. Communities reported feeling safer as a result of the engineering structures.

Another key factor contributing to project success was the engagement and commitment of local, district and provincial stakeholders, resulting in strengthening of local institutional



linkages related to GLOF. Community-based DRM approaches were developed in an integrated combination of indigenous and high-tech early warning systems. The reach of the project is beyond the GLOF issue: it has the potential for a real contribution to a more holistic flood warning/EWS, multi-hazard DRM and downstream impact reduction. There is scope for both thematic and geographic scaling-up.

The project greatly enhanced the knowledge base about GLOF in Pakistan (including an updated glacial lakes inventory) and its experience of implementing various pioneering interventions could enhance effectiveness of future such programmes. However, one shortcoming highlighted in the project evaluation report was the – as yet untapped – scope for regional learning: notably from the experiences of Bhutan and Nepal which also face GLOF risks.

#### *Promotion of Energy Efficiency in Cooking, Heating and Housing Technologies*

A UN project in the Northern Areas and Chitral sought to improve household economies and improve health through efficient use of wood fuel and energy efficient (EE) housing construction technologies. The project took a holistic approach to promoting use of EE cooking, heating and housing technologies. Awareness-raising in the programming area was linked with support to a micro-finance institution to offer financing services for procurement of EE products. Local and regional manufacturing and entrepreneur/craftsman capacities were strengthened using a variety of practical training and internship/apprenticeship models as well as training institution arrangements. Economic incentives were provided to bring entrepreneurs and craftsmen closer to local communities needing to be served. A complementary component enhanced the institutional capacity for needed policy development, implementation and awareness of the socioeconomic importance and benefits of EE and seismic resistance technologies among key local, provincial and national policy makers, provincial-level planners, managers, vocational/ technical educators and the private sector. This holistic approach greatly contributed to the project's success.

One factor that helped 'win over' communities was highlighting the multiple benefits of using clean and energy efficient technologies. For example, local households which use energy efficient (EE) stoves that include integrated exhaust expulsion and simple water warming systems, reduce the production of greenhouse gases (GHG) as a consequence of this also reduce their biomass consumption. The latter implies real savings for households in terms of cash spent on purchased fuel and time spent on gathering firewood from the forest. Used properly, the same products also result in warmer rooms, yet much less smoke and burnt soot in homes; better hygiene, and, better health of family members. Both the direct and indirect benefits create incentives for local stakeholders to invest in EE products.

Another feature of the project noted in the evaluation report was the adaptation of project activities to the cultural and practical needs of beneficiaries. For example, the size and shape of stoves and windows were adapted to suit local preferences, thereby helping to sell products. It also noted that the best products for people – the ones which they would want to adopt and buy – were not necessarily those that saved the most money. The lesson from this is that local people's conceptions of 'quality of life' and 'aesthetic quality' should taken into account when designing any assistance package. Another example was the project taking into account the seasonal nature of most potential clients' purchasing power (i.e., post-harvest). There was essentially a two month period of time – post-harvest - when people wanted to purchase EE

products, and therefore loan products for such purchases. Working with manufacturers and entrepreneurs to ensure that product availability corresponded with the seasonal nature of customers' needs and affordability helped to develop a customer-friendly market and better livelihoods for craftsmen and suppliers.

The evaluation report lauded the very positive impact of the project on women – both as direct beneficiaries - reduced burden of housework (collecting wood), improved health (less exposure to smoke) – and in perhaps unexpected ways. The project focused on women as the catalysts for change in their communities. Village Resource Persons (VRPs) were trained and facilitated to act as commission-based sales agents and generate demand within communities by raising awareness with regards to energy efficient cooking, heating and housing technologies. 90% of Village Resource Persons (VRPs) were women. The intervention provided them with skills and confidence and the commission based sales mechanism enabled women to earn money and improve their livelihood status.

While the overall achievements of the project were impressive, the evaluation report raised questions about long-term sustainability. Many EE products were subsidized for villagers and transaction costs for manufacturers. This helped promote the products and enabled more households to acquire them, but also kept prices artificially low. With the end of the project and removal of subsidies, prices could be expected to rise significantly – creating uncertainty about future demand. Furthermore, the project was essentially a series of pilot activities, which – to really have an impact - need to be scaled up.

#### *Tackling Narcotics Trafficking*

SPA3 includes policies, plans and institutions are enabled to prevent and manage narcotics trafficking-related challenges. A UN programme to promote the rule of law and public health in Pakistan was designed to bring about safer communities, free from the threats posed by organized crime and drug use and confident in the integrity of the criminal justice system to provide access to justice. As such, it took a holistic approach with sub-components focused on: illicit trafficking and border management; the criminal justice system; and drug demand reduction and HIV/AIDS. Progress was made on all three fronts, notably: establishment of computer-based training centres in law enforcement agency (LEA) academies and institutions; introduction of modern policing methods, especially investigation procedures, and enhanced police-prosecutor coordination; improved availability of drug use data, and enhanced drug dependence treatment, rehabilitation and related HIV services.

The program evaluation report identified a number of factors contributing to its success, notable among which was the investment in dedicated research projects and baseline assessments prior to programme design. It also lauded the move away from stand-alone projects to an integrated country programme as something promoting coherence and allowing greater flexibility to respond to emerging needs. In practice, however, the evaluation report said the sub-components were still operating as separate projects and there were insufficient horizontal linkages between sub-components.

A key criticism made in the evaluation report was that, for a programme that promoted the rule of law, human rights and gender equality were markedly absent. It noted there had been little analysis of these issues, and there were few interventions to address these. The evaluation report suggested these had been excluded at the request of the government.

## **Strategic Priority Area 4:**

# **Strengthened Governance and Social Cohesion**

## 4.1 SPA4: Progress Assessment

Pakistan has made huge strides in promoting democracy and governance in recent years, with a (permanent) return to civilian rule and extensive devolution of powers and responsibilities to provincial governments. Many challenges remain, however, particularly in relation to the rule of law and access to justice, accountability and social protection - and particularly for the poorest and most vulnerable. OPII seeks to strengthen governance and social cohesion in Pakistan by building on the progress to date. Specifically, it seeks to promote democratic norms, strengthen justice sector institutions and build capacity to tackle crime, ensure social protection measures reach the most vulnerable and disadvantaged, and build capacity of governments to effectively implement devolution.

**Outcome 4.1 - The capacity of institutions to be more democratic and accountable is strengthened, including *inter alia*, the engagement of civil society organizations, media and academia**

*Output 4.1.1 National legislation reflects commitments to human rights and relevant UN Conventions and treaties*

*Output 4.1.2 Federal and provincial committees and secretariats are better able to carry out effective oversight*

*Output 4.1.3 Civil society and media are better able to promote participation of people in democratic processes and public dialogue and discourse*

*Output 4.1.4 The electoral administration, systems and processes of the Election Commission and its field offices are reformed and aligned with international standards and best practices*

Progress in relation to output 4.1.1 is evident largely in the promulgation of provincial labour laws – required in the wake of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment. The UN provided technical assistance for this to all provincial governments as well as the federal government, ensuring that the new laws were aligned to international standards. As of end 2014, 25 labour laws had been enacted across the four provinces (13 in Punjab, 10 in KP, 2 in Sindh and 1 in Balochistan). The UN also supported the federal and provincial governments in strengthening labour administration, including labour inspection and occupational safety. Tripartite committees on labour administration – with representation of government, employers and workers – have been formally notified at federal and provincial level. A further area of legislation supported by the UN was promoting freedom of information – this is described under SPA5.

With regard to joint output 4.1.2, the UN supported Parliamentary Committees in conducting public hearings and consultations, carrying out outreach (communications), conducting research, and carrying out effective government oversight. In 2014 the UN provided technical and operational support for the establishment of Parliamentary MDG Task Forces at federal and provincial level, aimed at strengthening parliamentary oversight towards accomplishment of the MDGs. [However, these committees took a long time to become functional, meaning that little had been achieved by the end of 2014.] UN support for Women's Parliamentary Caucus is detailed under SPA5.

The UN worked closely with the Climate Change Division (CCD) at federal level to analyse urban development and formulate a national framework for this, which provinces can then link with through their respective urban policies and action plans. The CCD notified a national habitat committee which was supported by the UN, while work on setting up provincial habitat committees is underway. These efforts will promote improved urban development practices, particularly in relation to land governance, slum up-gradation and climate change adaptation. Progress has already been made on land governance with the UN supporting the KP Government to computerize and digitize land records: a successful pilot is being replicated in four districts of the province. The online system is having a significant impact in reducing land ownership disputes, and increasing transparency and accountability. Studies by the UN on slums in Peshawar and Kohat (with KP Urban Policy Unit) and in Islamabad have facilitated governments in (devising policies for) upgrading slum settlements.

Women's empowerment was a major focus of UN efforts under both joint output 4.1.3 - promoting women's political participation - and output 4.1.4 - supporting the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to carry out gender mainstreaming. These activities and achievements are discussed under SPA5. However, with this exception, there is little evidence of other initiatives under output 4.1.3 to enable civil society and the media to promote participation of people in democratic processes and public dialogue.

Under output 4.1.4, the UN assisted the ECP in carrying out other major improvements in electoral systems. It worked with the ECP and NADRA to improve the electoral roll through measures such as adding voters' photos and removing duplications. A further safeguard against ballot stuffing was the addition of information requirements on results forms: total number of registered voters, and total number of votes cast. Emphasis was placed on capacity building: almost 2,000 master trainers were trained, going on to train around 330,000 polling officials. A massive voter education campaign encouraging people - especially women and youth - to vote, reached over 40 million citizens, and contributed to the 55% turnout in the 2013 general election (up from 44% in 2008). Finally, the UN supported the ECP to develop an improved elections results management system - this was effectively used in the 2013 elections, yielding a database of polling station results from which to analyse voting patterns and trends. Also for the first time, figures for votes cast were sex-disaggregated, allowing turnout of women voters to be analysed.

**Outcome 4.2 - Rule of law and public security institutions strengthened to enhance public trust and social stability, and to provide improved safety and security, including measures to address transnational crime and trafficking**

*Output 4.2.1 Effective and efficient structures and mechanisms in place and operational to ensure that the poor and marginalized are better able to access justice*

*Output 4.2.2 Communities, including rural poor and refugees benefit from grievance redress mechanisms*

*Output 4.2.3 The criminal justice system is better able to identify and respond to national and transnational crime*

Under output 4.2.1, the main mechanisms through which the UN has promoted access to justice for the poor and marginalized are provision of legal advice and aid, and promotion of alternative dispute resolution. Legal aid desks and mobile legal aid clinics, set up with UN assistance in all districts of Malakand Division, KP, raised awareness of the law and their rights among

community members – many of them women - and provided them legal assistance. The UN supported training of community paralegals and *jirga* members, improving quality of alternative dispute resolution. These initiatives enhanced community trust in justice institutions.

Access to justice is even harder for refugees and asylum seekers in Pakistan, who often face the threat of arrest and detention. Under output 4.2.2 the UN helped these vulnerable groups secure their legal rights by setting up ten Advice and Legal Aid Centres (ALAC) – spread over all four provinces and Islamabad. These provide legal assistance to refugees in cases of arrest, detention, SGBV incidents, civil or family disputes. Specifically, the UN was able to assist many hundreds of arrested or detained Proof of Registration (PoR) cardholders. The UN also conducted awareness raising sessions on refugee and human rights law for key stakeholder such as the police, border officials and prosecutors. Grievance redress and protection was provided by the UN for large numbers of IDPs, displaced from North Waziristan Agency (NWA). In 2014 alone almost 50,000 grievances were recorded and assistance provided to almost 25,000 TRPs. A vulnerability assessment of IDPs conducted by the UN identified several thousand families eligible for assistance: thousands of IDPs were assisted to obtain CNIC, a requirement for IDP registration.

UN efforts in relation to output 4.2.3 targeted all aspects of the criminal justice system: the police, prosecution service, courts and prisons. The geographic focus of these initiatives was KP. The UN conducted training of police officials, set up e-learning centres and an e-learning platform offering 92 modules on different aspects of law enforcement (human trafficking, money laundering, drugs, etc), piloted community policing in a number of KP districts, set up a forensic science laboratory and regional training centre for police in Swat, and promoted coordination between police and prosecution departments through joint forums. As well as capacity building of prosecutors in KP, the UN supported the refurbishment of seven DPP offices in Malakand Division. The KP Judicial Academy was strengthened and trainings conducted for judges and court staff.

As part of efforts to strengthen legislation, the UN supported drafting of Service Rules for the Punjab Prosecution Department and organized consultations on the draft Mutual Legal Assistance Act. To improve prison management, the UN revised Prison Rules for all four provinces: these have been approved in KP while the process is underway in the others. The UN also convened a forum for prison Inspector Generals from across the country to meet and discuss challenges and solutions.

### **Outcome 4.3 - Improved accountability and access to quality social protection and other services for excluded and vulnerable people**

*Output 4.3.1 Social protection policies and legal frameworks harmonized with relevant international treaties ratified by Pakistan and reflect regional best practice*

*Output 4.3.2 National and provincial institutions have enhanced capacity and robust systems to implement social protection and social insurance schemes for the most vulnerable*

*Output 4.3.3 Duty bearers and right holders are aware, motivated and practice/promote peace building*

*Output 4.3.4 Transparent and accountable registration services are available for children, refugees and other target groups*

#### *Output 4.3.5 Policies and institutions for refugees management developed and strengthened*

Under outputs 4.3.1 and 4.3.2, the UN supported drafting of the KP Social Protection Policy; this was subsequently approved and the KP Government now has a fully operational Social Policy Reform Unit. The new policy has been piloted in two districts, with District Social Protection Committees notified and trained. KP also saw the establishment by the UN of women friendly spaces (WFS) and women facilitation centres (WFC), providing services for women and children. The comfort and security provided by these facilities enabled many women to register cases of violence they had experienced, leading to several cases being processed. The success of this UN initiative prompted the Government of KP to take over responsibility for the spaces/centres – ensuring sustainability - with further such facilities set for inclusion in the KP Annual Development Plan.

The UN promoted the ‘peace building’ called for in output 4.3.3 through a number of social cohesion measures, largely focused on the education sector. It conducted an analysis of social cohesion and resilience, aimed at identifying conflict drivers and factors promoting peace. The findings were used to devise interventions, which were incorporated into the Sindh and Balochistan education sector plans (ESPs). As part of efforts to promote mainstreaming of SCR, the UN supported inclusion of this in continuous professional development (CPD) programmes for teachers and in training of textbook writers/reviewers. In another initiative, families from different ethnic, tribal and religious communities allowed their children to interact together on a weekly basis, and the UN trained youth leaders in peer mediation and conflict resolution.

A major focus of UN efforts in relation to output 4.3.4 was on birth registration: both raising awareness of the importance of this, and building capacity of governments to carry this out. The UN carried out a systematic bottleneck analysis to identify the causes of low birth registration rates; the findings were used to devise provincial strategies to address the issue. The success of a pilot scheme by the UN, making use of mobile phone technology to register births, led to this being included in some provincial strategies. The UN also supported South-South learning on birth registration schemes: high level government participation in such learning exchanges resulted in the establishment of the National Steering Committee on Civil Registration and Vital Statistics. To promote behaviour change, the UN supported a national campaign on birth registration launched in 2013 and successfully advocated for waiver of the late registration fee – a potential deterrent for many parents. As a result of networking with existing community-based actors, the importance of birth registration is now regularly communicated by LHWs and through polio community social mobilizers.

In relation to outputs 4.3.4 and 4.3.5, the UN provided extensive support both for management of refugees within Pakistan, and to facilitate the repatriation of Afghan refugees as well as IDPs from conflict in FATA. The UN continued its engagement with the Government of Pakistan to ensure the achievement of international refugee rights, and to bring about appropriate policies and referral systems distinguishing between refugees and migrants. It also assisted thousands of applicants to obtain Proof of Registration (PoR) cards, important protection for Afghan refugees while in Pakistan and giving them access to UN assistance if they voluntarily repatriate.

The UN undertook mass awareness raising campaigns in refugee villages, informing people about the voluntary repatriation programme for refugees. Many people were supported



through the Assisted Voluntary Returns (AVR) project and the Assisted Voluntary Returns and Repatriation (AVRR) projects. The UN also facilitated applicants resettling to other countries such as the United States. Domestically, the UN assisted many IDPs to obtain CNIC, essential for registering as IDPs and accessing humanitarian aid. It developed a two-year integrated programme to support temporarily displaced families returning to FATA: the three focus areas are ensuring food security and livelihoods, improving basic services, and promoting governance and social cohesion.

#### **Outcome 4.4 - Strengthened decentralized governance**

*Output 4.4.1 Relevant legislation and policies developed at the provincial/area and district levels to facilitate equity, sustainability and inclusiveness*

*Output 4.4.2 Provincial institutions/departments undertake reform to carry out their functions in line with the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment*

In the wake of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, the UN partnered with both federal and provincial governments to operationalize frameworks and forums to realize the benefits of devolution. It helped build the capacity of the Secretariat of the Council of Common Interests, and helped it set up a Devolution Information Management System to document and streamline the devolution process. In KP, the UN supported district level consultations on a new local government law, raised awareness about the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment and supported research on federalism and devolution in Pakistan, and carried out advocacy for implementation of right to information provisions. In Gilgit-Baltistan, the UN provided technical assistance to the standing committee on local governance to finalize and pass the Gilgit-Baltistan Local Government Act 2014.

Much of the focus of UN efforts in relation to devolution has been Balochistan, where it helped establish the Chief Minister's Policy Reform Unit in Quetta – a body aimed at helping provincial departments in making the necessary policies, frameworks and structures to implement devolution. The UN assisted the Balochistan Law Department in undertaking post-devolution amendments to a number of laws, and carried out baseline studies on the state of public finance and of school education in the province with the relevant line departments. In 2014 the UN brought key stakeholders in Balochistan together for a pre-budget consultation, resulting in a number of recommendations, some of which were subsequently included in the provincial budget.

There are a number of specific devolved functions which the UN supported provincial governments to carry out. One is control of foot and mouth disease (FMD): the UN helped set up eight FMD diagnostic labs across the country, built capacity of lab staff to diagnose FMD and of livestock farmers and field staff to monitor and respond to FMD outbreaks, provided vaccines, and helped draft a National Control Plan for FMD. Similar interventions (awareness-raising, capacity building, improving lab facilities, etc) were carried out by the UN to control PPR, a viral disease affecting sheep and goats. The UN helped build capacity in Punjab and Sindh for crop forecasting and estimation – essential for food security and the country's economy. Also in Punjab and Sindh, the UN carried out a survey of current fertilizer use practices in several districts, with the aim of improving soil fertility management.



## 4.2 SPA4: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*There were only a handful of reports available to review in relation to SPA4. These covered quite diverse themes: capacity building of law enforcement agencies, tackling foot and mouth disease, and building social cohesion.*

E-learning for law enforcement agencies can be a cost-effective, accessible and sustainable way to promote learning, capable of reaching thousands of people across the country.

Appropriate institutional arrangements for programme implementation can facilitate government engagement and commitment, leading to improved results. In a UN project to tackle foot and mouth disease, for example, government had a clear role in decision-making through the steering committee and this contributed to strong government commitment to the project.

Use of subsidies and incentives can be effective in achieving programme targets, but is problematic in the long-run as it undermines sustainability. Programme interventions and approaches should be designed on the understanding that, once the programme ends and external funding is removed, results should sustain.

Cost reduction – finding cheap, local sources of products rather than expensive imports – can be one way to promote sustainability. Programme interventions should seek to identify cost-effective solutions (including if necessary building local capacity for production).

While it can be convenient for UN programmes to engage with larger stakeholders (e.g. in the case of tackling FMD, large dairy producers/commercial units) rather than multiple smaller ones (small farmers/individual households with livestock), it is important to engage with and support the latter. Often these will be in greater need of assistance and less capable of securing it themselves; supporting them is also important in the context of promoting equity and helping vulnerable groups.

Livestock management at household level is typically carried out (to a large extent) by women. Interventions to improve livestock management should therefore aim to include women and be designed in such a way as to facilitate their participation. Again, as well as being effective in relation to improving livestock management, this is important from a gender equality perspective.

Building social cohesion at community level requires a multi-pronged (holistic) approach. Alongside conventional development initiatives it is important carry out measures specifically aimed at building peace and promoting tolerance. Where appropriate and relevant, reference to religious beliefs and texts can be used to support such efforts.

## Review Findings

While there has been significant progress under SPA4 in a number of areas<sup>7</sup>, there were only two programme reports relevant to SPA4 for the meta-review to assess (plus agency reports).

### *Building Capacity of Law Enforcement Agencies*

The first was a rule of law and public health programme, the findings of which have been detailed in the SPA3 chapter. The relevant agency report identified the e-learning programme for law enforcement agencies as one of the most successful components of the country programme, with many thousands of hours of education delivered nationally and a virtual doubling in knowledge among participants (based on comparison of pre-course and post-course test results). E-learning is a particularly cost-effective, accessible and sustainable approach to promoting learning, capable of reaching far greater numbers of beneficiaries than 'conventional' training courses/workshops.

### *Control of Foot and Mouth Disease*

The second was a UN project to develop a framework for progressive control of foot-and-mouth disease (FMD) achieved significant results (even surpassing targets): improvement in FMD diagnosis capacity, improvement in FMD surveillance and field response, and development of an effective vaccination strategy. The evaluation report particularly lauded the strong project management as a success factor, and the institutional oversight arrangement of a technical working group and a steering committee which gave government a clear role in decision-making. The report said government had demonstrated commitment through its close involvement with project implementation at both federal and field levels and this had been instrumental in efficient implementation. On the technical side, it highlighted the fact that, in a dynamic, endemic setting where there are changing FMD virus serotypes and subtypes, the project had shown the importance of monitoring circulating virus strains and matching these with vaccine procurement specifications.

However, the evaluation report raised concerns about sustainability, particularly because many interventions were dependent on subsidies and incentives. Subsidies included free vaccine, two senior laboratory technician salaries, provision of sample kits and laboratory consumables. Incentives included vaccine cost-sharing and the fees paid for sample submission, outbreak response and laboratory testing. The report said the existing model's foundation on subsidies and incentives suggested that it might collapse without continued external funding: no exit strategy had been elaborated. As a measure to reduce vaccination costs – and thus promote sustainability as well as accessibility for poor farmers – the evaluation report recommended that the project provide technical advice to produce large quantities of cheaper vaccine in Pakistan.

The FMD project appeared to neglect issues of equality and non-discrimination. The evaluation report found no evidence that the project had statistical data that was disaggregated by gender or vulnerable groups such as the poor or particular ethnic groups. Poor farmers' needs were

---

<sup>7</sup> Promulgation of provincial labour laws, urban development, strengthening of electoral systems, provision of legal aid (including to refugees), capacity building of justice sector agencies (police, prosecution and prisons), social protection, social cohesion through education, birth registration and support for decentralized governance – see Section 4.1 for details.

not prioritized in project design or implementation. Indeed, the project appeared to work mainly with large producers: the main beneficiaries were the larger, commercial farmers and dairies. This was despite the project itself having shown that poor farmers would participate in FMD vaccination if there was locally available high quality vaccine.

The evaluation report noted that the capacity building provided to farmers had reached an audience that was more than 99% men. It acknowledged that this could be appropriate given that men managed the dairy buffalo and cow units with which the project primarily worked and men made decisions about vaccinating animals. But it added that on small farms women milk animals, and can have a role in recognising when animals are sick and in tending sick animals. Moreover research indicated that, in general in Pakistan and Afghanistan, women have greater involvement in livestock-related activities compared to men: research in Punjab clearly showed that most livestock-related activities there are carried out by women. This was not addressed in the project.

#### *Community Mobilization and Development to Promote Social Cohesion*

Community mobilization was lauded as a positive feature in the context of a programme promoting livelihood restoration and DRR in Sindh. The evaluation report said that social capital generated in the form of community organizations was expected to help sustain activities supported under the programme.

A UN agency report detailed initiatives being taken by a number of UN agencies in a single union council of Tehsil Daraban, District Dera Ismail Khan to promote local development with the aim of building social cohesion and improving security. Some interventions had a specific 'peace building' thrust, e.g. training teachers on inclusive education, distribution of radio sets and airing of radio dramas on peace, conduct of street theatre on themes of peace and tolerance. Others had a more conventional development focus, e.g. support for female literacy and provision of sewing machines to women, rehabilitation/up-gradation of ponds and installation of rainwater harvesting ponds. A training module on rainwater harvesting was developed in English and Urdu; it drew on the Quran and Sunnah to highlight the importance of water. The agency report said these interventions were showing visible results on ground. This project, albeit small-scale, is an example of successful coordination on ground between multiple UN agencies.

## **Strategic Priority Area 5:**

### **Gender Equality and Social Justice**

## 5.1 SPA 5: Progress Assessment

There has been progress in Pakistan in recent years in tackling gender inequality – evident, for example, in the country’s international commitments and national policies on the issue, and in women’s increased political participation. Despite this, the country still features around the bottom of global rankings on gender development and equity. OPPI seeks to ensure that women and other vulnerable groups are able to access their basic rights. It focuses on the policy and legislative environment, strengthening of government institutions and capacity building of duty bearers, and on giving vulnerable and excluded groups a greater say in decision-making.

### **Outcome 5.1 Government and civil society are active and accountable in eliminating discrimination against women and girls**

*Output 5.1.1 National laws and legislation are revised to bring them into line with international frameworks on women’s rights (in particular CEDAW and CRC)*

*Output 5.1.2 National, provincial and area policy-makers and planners are able to collect, analyze and use high quality sex disaggregated data to address biases that prevent women and girls from fulfilling their rights*

*Output 5.1.3 Civil society and women’s groups have enhanced lobbying capacity to demand accountability and advocate for the implementation of women friendly legislation*

Under output 5.1.1, the UN supported the National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) and other stakeholders to develop a ‘national statement’ on EVAWG. This was presented at the 57<sup>th</sup> Commission on the Status of Women in New York, and introduces a 12-point plan on the way forward for policy and legislation to bring about EVAWG. Since the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, the role of provincial governments and legislation has gained much greater significance. The UN provided technical assistance for the formulation (and in some cases adoption) of provincial frameworks on gender equality in Balochistan, Sindh, KP and FATA, and passage of Domestic Violence Bills in line with CEDAW in Sindh, Balochistan and Pakistan Administered Kashmir. The UN has also engaged intensively with the Inter-Provincial Ministerial Group (IPMG) on Women’s Development to prioritize and address key women’s issues. This is significant because, as the only inter-provincial coordination forum, the IPMG has the potential to promote provincial level support for women’s empowerment in line with national and international commitments.

The 2013 national and provincial elections saw women play an increasing role in political processes. The UN’s work with the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) led to it adopting a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in December 2013, and to key elements of the strategy being included in the ECP’s Strategic Plan for 2014-18. UN efforts contributed to the passage of a Bill in Punjab for establishment of the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women, and to setting up of a Standing Committee on Women’s Empowerment within the Balochistan Assembly. Women Parliamentary Caucus (WPC) at provincial level aim to promote and increase women’s participation in politics, legislation and decision-making. The UN supported the drafting of Strategic Plans for four provincial WPC, and brought together stakeholders to discuss relevant issues like the quota system for women parliamentarians. The UN took this national initiative to

regional level at a South Asia Forum in Nepal in 2014, bringing together women parliamentarians, election bodies and others from across South Asia. The result was commitment for a regional agenda to promote women's political empowerment and to initiate collective measures to tackle violence against women – identified as a major hurdle to women's empowerment in all fields.

Under output 5.1.2 a few knowledge products were generated supporting formulation of gender responsive policies or plans and evidence-based decision-making. These include gender profiles of Balochistan and FATA, a 'Status of Women and Men' report, and reports on the policy seminars and regional conference on women's political participation. The UN supported the ECP in the 2013 elections to generate sex-disaggregated voter data and, in the wake of the elections, commissioned a study on violence against women in politics. Little else seems to have been done under output 5.1.2 to generate sex-disaggregated data to support evidence-based policy-making.

Progress on joint output 5.1.3 – building capacity of civil society and women's groups to lobby for implementation of women-friendly legislation and demand accountability - is less apparent.

**Outcome 5.2 Political, economic, social and legal rights of all, and especially excluded groups, are respected, protected and fulfilled, including through institutional strengthening and capacity development of duty bearers**

*Output 5.2.1 National and provincial/area policies, strategies, capacities and programmes targeting the most marginalized children and youth are coherent, complementary and promote collaboration*

*Output 5.2.2 National and provincial/area policies, strategies and programmes that reduce exploitation and promote decent work, targeting the most excluded groups, are coherent and complementary, and promote collaboration*

*Output 5.2.3 National and provincial policies, strategies and programmes protect the rights of excluded groups*

Under output 5.2.1, interventions were carried out in a number of provinces and regions. UN support led to the adoption of Youth Policies by relevant provincial departments in Balochistan, KP, PAK and Gilgit-Baltistan. In Punjab, the UN supported the government to establish a Punjab Youth Parliamentary Caucus: comprising young parliamentarians, its mandate is to bring about necessary policy reforms for the development of adolescent girls and youth in Punjab.

Tackling child labour and promoting decent work were the focus of UN activities under output 5.2.2. The UN played a key role in bringing about the Integrated Project on Child and Bonded Labour, a seven-year project launched in November 2014 and to be implemented in 36 districts of Punjab. This major project addresses all aspects of child and bonded labour: strengthening legislation, building capacity of government bodies, supporting rehabilitation of freed labourers, promoting knowledge sharing with other provinces. Significantly, the Punjab Government was able to mobilize Rs. 51 M of its own funds for the project; in KP the government similarly found funds for child labour units – ensuring their sustainability. The UN also worked directly with the Government of Balochistan, undertaking baseline studies to identify the scale of child labour in the province, thereby enabling evidence-based policies to address it. As well as government, the UN has partnered with other stakeholders, notably the Pakistan Workers Federation and the Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP), providing them technical assistance to lobby the

private and public sector to implement International Labour Standards (ILS) and tackle child and bonded labour. UN support to the EFP led to the drafting and adoption of codes of conduct regulating child labour in nine hazardous sectors.

Promoting labour rights for women was a focus area of UN efforts. In Sindh and KP, labour departments were assisted to review labour laws and make these more gender equitable. The UN was instrumental in helping governments in Balochistan, Punjab and Sindh to endorse and implement the Gender Responsive Labour Inspection (GRLI) toolkit to collect labour inspection data. Home-based workers (HBW), the majority of whom are women, are not covered by laws in Pakistan. However, in 2013 the Sindh and Punjab Assemblies passed resolutions to adopt a law for HBW. The UN strengthened the capacity of the Sindh and Punjab Labour and Human Resource Departments to collect data and register HBWs, and facilitate their access to social security benefits.

Progress on output 5.2.3 was made in the areas of child protection and gender-based violence (GBV). The UN spearheaded the first-ever comprehensive mapping and assessment of child protection systems in Sindh, Punjab, KP, Balochistan and GB respectively. It also developed innovative new modules for a child protection information management system: the strengthened system is being piloted in districts in all four provinces. The UN supported the Government of Pakistan to review and amend the Juvenile Justice System Ordinance 2000 (JJSO) to ensure full compliance with the CRC and the Beijing Rules (for administration of juvenile justice). UN advocacy and lobbying contributed to a resolution being passed by the Punjab Assembly in December 2014 increasing the minimum age of marriage for girls to 18 years.

With regard to GBV, the UN played a key role in ensuring this is effectively addressed by the public health system. The UN supported formulation of the National Protocol on Treatment and Health Sector Response to GBV; provincial action plans for implementation of these protocols were subsequently developed in all four provinces and capacity building undertaken of health sector professionals in responding to GBV and gender-sensitive health planning.

### **Outcome 5.3 Human rights institutions strategically positioned and advocating for integrating human rights at all levels**

*Output 5.3.1 Capacity of NHRIs to promote and protect human rights at national and provincial levels strengthened*

*Output 5.3.2 Civil society and human rights bodies are able to act as independent monitoring and reporting mechanism on the status of human rights*

*Output 5.3.3 Relevant government and civil society mechanisms to monitor and report on the implementation of the concluding observations and remarks of the committees of all relevant international Treaties and Conventions are functioning effectively*

There appears to be little evidence of any significant initiatives or progress in relation to joint output 5.3.1 – building capacity of national stakeholders to promote and protect human rights.

Efforts under joint output 5.3.2 were seen largely in relation to media freedom and safety of journalists. Pakistan is one of the most dangerous countries in the world for journalists. The UN Action Plan on Safety of Journalists and Issue of Impunity was launched in 2013, with Pakistan one of five pilot countries for the initiative. The campaign highlights the responsibility of governments to protect journalists from threat and to combat impunity, and aims to help

countries strengthen legislation and mechanisms for freedom of expression and information. As part of this effort in Pakistan, the UN organised four large-scale advocacy events to create impetus for better protection for journalists and media workers and to raise awareness of the importance of freedom of expression. The UN Action Plan was endorsed by the Government of Pakistan in October 2013.

The UN supported monitoring and reporting by civil society bodies on sexual and gender-based violence (SGBV) and on HIV. The UN's approach to tackling SGBV combined awareness-raising, capacity building of teachers and other duty bearers, and facilitating victims and survivors to report abuse and receive help through community structures and/or specialised services. UN engagement on the GBV issue led to a GBV sub-cluster being set up under the protection cluster as part of the emergency response in Bannu district of KP in 2014. The UN supported three women-friendly health spaces in the district to provide healthcare, counselling and vocational training to GBV victims. As well as refugee communities in KP, such efforts targeted schools in Punjab and Balochistan.

In relation to HIV, the UN provided technical assistance to align the civil society response to HIV to the national response, and to promote better monitoring and reporting of people living with HIV, people who inject drugs, transgender and other sexual minorities. A review by the UN in 2014 of legislation, policies and institutional frameworks (in particular access to HIV and health services) to safeguard the human rights of these key groups affected by HIV, established a baseline and provided evidence-based recommendations for improvement.

In relation to output 5.3.3, UN engagement with the Inter-Provincial Working Group (IPWG) on Women's Development and its advocacy on improving monitoring and reporting on CEDAW and UPR, led to the IPWG adopting a set of key indicators on CEDAW reporting in November 2014. The key indicators and a standard reporting format are being institutionalised by the CEDAW Provincial Committees, after which they will develop standardized tools to collect information. The UN also supported the NCSW, EVAWG Alliance and other stakeholders to prepare the National Review Report 20 years on from the 1995 Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action. The Beijing+20 Report was submitted by NCSW to the government for onward submission. UN technical assistance to the Ministry of Human Rights enabled it to draft a bill for the National Commission on the Rights of the Child; the UN also assisted the government in preparing the 5<sup>th</sup> periodic report on the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.



## 5.2 SPA 5: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*The main evaluation report assessed for SPA5 of the meta-review was for a programme focused on women's economic empowerment, and specifically home-based workers. Agency reports also provided useful insights.*

When trying to bring about reform a multi-pronged approach comprising (as relevant) advocacy and legislative change, engagement with government and other stakeholders at all levels (national, provincial and local), mobilization and organization of affected groups, and on-ground practical interventions to improve the condition of affected groups is important.

District level institutional arrangements to enable interaction between rights holders and duty bearers can be an effective approach to bring about change. Interactions at this level give rights holders access to decision-makers, and help duty bearers understand people's issues and needs.

Mobilizing and organizing vulnerable groups into 'collectives' (e.g. associations, unions, action groups) will greatly enhance their position in relation to duty bearers – this empowerment has been seen in the formation of HBW groups, able to collectively negotiate with employers and secure better remuneration.

NGOs can play a critical role in grassroots level mobilization and organization of community members. But it is important to ensure that mobilized groups do not become dependent on NGOs; they should be given capacity building support and guidance to be able to (in the long-term) independently advance their respective agendas.

Giving home based workers support and training to engage in alternative sources of livelihood, such as entrepreneurship, can help increase their income significantly.

Gender based violence (GBV) is a difficult problem to tackle in Pakistan because of conservative social attitudes which promote acceptance of GBV to some extent, denial of its existence by many (including in government) and obstacles to reporting GBV cases. Hire of dedicated personnel to address GBV by UN agencies can facilitate mainstreaming of GBV across different sectors, e.g. health, education.

### Review Findings

The most relevant SPA5 programme report assessed by the meta-review related to an initiative to promote women's economic empowerment and, specifically, to improve the condition of home based workers (HBW) – many of whom are women. An agency report reflected on approaches to tackling gender-based violence.

#### *Empowerment of Home Based Workers*

The evaluation report noted that the programme took a multi-pronged approach to improving the situation of HBWs: promoting passage of legislation, facilitating HBWs to access social

protection programmes and register for social security, providing training in alternate livelihoods, and providing access to microfinance. The strength of the programme lay in this multi-pronged approach that included engagement with parliamentarians and the relevant national women's machineries (NCSW, PCSW and WDDs) and partnerships with government departments at national and provincial levels and with CSOs.

The report detailed progress made on all fronts. While HBW laws and policies had not been passed, in Sindh the law had been moved from a draft to a vetted document, ready to be presented in the Provincial Assembly. In Punjab the HBW policy was awaiting cabinet approval. The role played in this by the different HBW platforms and by the District Action Committees (DAC) formed under the programme was highlighted.

In the absence of a proper HBW law or policy, registration of HBWs with social security institutions was not possible. But the programme had facilitated HBWs to access benefits from other sources, notably government social protection programs e.g. BISP<sup>8</sup>, Pakistan Baitul Mal and Zakat funds. Furthermore, LHRDs<sup>9</sup> collected data of 9,200 HBWs in Sindh, and a similar exercise was underway in three districts of Punjab, while CSOs had data on approximately 4,000 HBWs. Once data entry was complete the registration of HBWs with LHRDs would begin.

In relation to improving existing skills and supporting alternative livelihoods, programme interventions developed diverse and alternate skills. Former soccer ball stitchers in Sialkot, for example, were able to learn alternative employable skills, e.g. gloves stitching, leather jacket stitching. Similarly HBWs in Karachi and Hyderabad learned alternate, value added skills in jewellery making, sewing, stitching shoes, purses and dates processing. HBWs in Sialkot and Lahore developed entrepreneurial skills and initiated small enterprises of catering, running shops and work-cum-training centres. Such initiatives led to increases in HBWs' income: some reported their monthly income going up from the previous PKR 2,500-3,000 to as much as PKR 11,000-15,000.

One success factor highlighted in the evaluation report was the grounding of work in the districts through CSOs and government departments, and the formation of District Action Committees (DACs), through which HBWs were able to access media, legal assistance and the district bureaucracy and articulate their demands appropriately. For the duty bearers, the DAC provided an opportunity to understand HBWs' issues.

The programme includes the organization and mobilization of HBW groups and district level awareness for HBWs advancement among the district offices for labour, the SWD, and local CSOs, and specifically addresses gender-based violence, reproductive health and rights and mobility of HBWs through linkages and referrals. The evaluation report lauded mobilization of HBWs by CSOs as another big strength of the programme - raising awareness about labour rights, creating an environment for group formation and trust building for collective bargaining. Confident HBWs were assertively seeking work orders, negotiating for better rates and interacting with line departments to resolve their issues.

However, the report also warned that mobilization of HBWs could lead to "CBO-ization" of HBWs, diverting attention from unionization, collective action, and the focus on labour rights,

---

<sup>8</sup> Benazir Income Support Programme

<sup>9</sup> Labour and Human Resource Departments

and creating competition for project funds. Further, even though local implementing partners had made efforts to link HBW groups to markets, and many were securing contracts on their own as well, there remained a risk of dependency on CSOs. This was because HBW groups' access to markets remained limited as were the skills to finish products according to market trends.

### *Tackling Gender Based Violence*

An agency report noted that gender based violence (GBV) is a highly sensitive subject in Pakistan. Gender discrimination and a conservative social culture make it hard for women to report and escape violence: there is relatively high acceptance of some forms of gender based violence among both men and women. Constant denial of the existence of GBV hinders prevention and response efforts. This is particularly so in a humanitarian context when GBV is not considered a priority. The report said that having dedicated personnel in UN agencies to work on tackling GBV could facilitate mainstreaming of GBV concerns across different sectors. In terms of interventions, engagement with midwives and sensitization of girls through the education system, were recommended.

## **Strategic Priority Area 6:**

### **Food and Nutrition Security for the most Vulnerable Groups**

## 6.1 SPA 6: Progress Assessment

Food insecurity is a problem affecting over half of households in Pakistan (National Nutrition Survey 2013), and is made worse by repeated humanitarian disasters and shocks. The One Programme II calls for an integrated approach to tackling food insecurity, through both humanitarian programmes and livelihood support. Nutrition security is to be promoted at policy level as well as through awareness-raising to improve nutritional practices and direct interventions to address acute malnutrition. OPII stresses the need for integration and coordination across diverse agencies (health, education, social protection, agriculture, forestry, livestock, irrigation and so on) at different levels (federal, provincial, local).

### **Outcome 6.1 Household food security increased**

#### ***Output 6.1.1 Integrated responses to improve food security***

Output 6.1.1 calls for an integrated approach to tackling food insecurity. Such an approach is evident in the UN's support for the development of multi-sector federal and provincial food security policies and strategies, in the way provision of food assistance has often been tied to participation in work schemes (often managed by local communities), and in the interventions across diverse sectors to promote livelihoods and income generation.

UN efforts led to high-level commitment to food security by the government (Joint Agriculture and Food Security Policy, establishment of the Food Security Coordination Cell), enabling the issue to be prioritised and addressed in a coordinated manner. The UN also supported conduct of a nationwide household survey on nutrition and food security; by providing an accurate picture of the situation in Pakistan and the factors promoting food insecurity and malnutrition, this will greatly help in evidence-based policy-making. Technical guidance from the UN was vital for improving preparedness and responsiveness to promote food security, including improving food and cash distribution modalities. Humanitarian hubs were established in key areas of KP and FATA, and the online data verification system set up by the UN ensured accountability, transparency and proper monitoring and reduced duplication.

As well as tying food assistance to participation in work schemes (e.g. 68,000 households in FATA took part in such a scheme in 2014), numerous interventions by the UN were aimed at increasing household income by improving crop and livestock productivity and strengthening market access. These include training on crop management, provision of quality seeds and stock, vaccination of livestock and guidance on marketing and developing value added products. Women have been particularly targeted in such initiatives.

### **Outcome 6.2 Nutrition security increased, especially for vulnerable and excluded groups**

#### ***Output 6.2.1 Provincial/regional governments have developed and implemented nutrition policies, strategies and plans to address malnutrition among the most disadvantaged/vulnerable population groups***

#### ***Output 6.2.2 Vulnerable population groups have improved their nutritional practices, i.e. infants, young children, pregnant and lactating women, adolescent girls***

#### ***Output 6.2.3 Effective prevention and treatment of acute malnutrition in the targeted communities***

Under output 6.2.1, the UN supported all four provinces and two regions to develop multi-sector nutrition policies and strategies. In addition, communities were supported to push (advocate) with regional and provincial governments for policies and strategies to tackle malnutrition. UN advocacy led to the Government of Pakistan signing up to the global Scaling-Up Nutrition (SUN) movement; the UN subsequently supported setting up of the SUN Business Network.

Under output 6.2.2, the UN targeted infants and children, pregnant and lactating women and adolescent girls through various large-scale feeding programmes. The school feeding programme in FATA was particularly effective in that it generated the very significant additional benefit of increased school enrolment and attendance and reduced drop-outs. Lady health workers were similarly effective in taking nutrition messages to rural communities – traditionally with less access to health services – and in promoting practices such as exclusive breastfeeding of babies under six months of age. The UN carried out extensive training of LHWs so they could perform this role in all provinces.

The principal modality used by the UN under output 6.2.3 was community-based management of acute malnutrition (CMAM). CMAM programmes were carried out on a large scale, reaching thousands of infants and young children, and pregnant and lactating women. Nutrition stabilization centres were set up in target areas. Thousands were also provided micronutrient supplements. The UN responded to the food crisis in Tharparkar, Sindh - where already high acute malnutrition rates among children were aggravated by the failure of rains in 2014 - by setting up a nutrition stabilization centre and feeding programmes for children and pregnant and lactating women.

## 6.2 SPA 6: Meta-Review Findings

### Key Lessons:

*In the context of food security and tackling malnutrition the meta-review was able to examine a large number of diverse programme reports, providing useful learning.*

It is important to involve target communities in identification and prioritization of DRR and other physical infrastructure schemes (in the context of cash for work/food for work programmes). Ensuring robust beneficiary feedback mechanisms can help improve project design during implementation.

Implementation of interventions through government structures and alignment of these with government strategies and policies (e.g. for agriculture, food security) can greatly enhance effectiveness and sustainability.

A critical question in the context of humanitarian responses (particularly in post-relief phases) is which aid modality to use: unconditional cash transfers, conditional cash transfers (e.g. cash for work, cash for education) and food (in kind) aid. Cash transfers have many advantages, notably low distribution costs and (often) beneficiary preference. But experience of OPII projects to date suggests that provision of in kind (food) aid can be better than cash transfers at ensuring beneficiaries meet food consumption targets.

The private sector can be an appropriate partner in some interventions – as seen in UN engagement with local food manufacturers to produce supplements to treat malnutrition. Factors/requirements for success include high level commitment by both sides (UN and private companies) and provision of sustained technical support by the UN. In such arrangements, it is possible to incentivise and support private sector involvement *without any financial investment* by the UN (though it could subsequently procure goods).

Capacity for local production of lipid-based nutrient supplements (LNS) was developed through UN assistance, but once procurement by the UN reduced (post-crisis) some manufacturers gave up LNS production. This has serious implications for LNS production in future emergencies: some method for ensuring sustained local LNS production capacity – that can be scaled up in emergency situations – needs to be found.

In the wake of the 2010/2011 floods disaster, the Punjab Government recognized that severe acute malnutrition (SAM) was a persistent problem and took steps from the outset to integrate outpatient therapeutic programmes (OTP) into primary health care. In Sindh, by contrast, SAM treatment during the crisis was carried out through a parallel system using NGOs – a resource-intensive and non-sustainable approach. Integration of OTP into public sector health care systems requires high-level government leadership.

In rural areas lacking health facilities (as in many parts of Balochistan), lady health workers can be effectively used to treat both MAM cases and SAM cases without medical complications. The ‘traditional’ mindset among health professionals that all SAM cases must be treated in health facilities with OTP, can mean that those unable to access those facilities get no treatment. However, using LHWs in this way will require investment in their recruitment and training.

## Review Findings

The meta-review looked at evaluation reports of a number of projects aimed at promoting food security and tackling malnutrition. While some of these were 'stand alone' projects, primarily focused on food security, others took an integrated approach, seeking to promote food security through/alongside livelihood promotion and/or disaster risk reduction. This analysis highlights some of the approaches taken to promoting food security/tackling malnutrition and the lessons that emerge for nutrition programmes.

### *Promoting Food Security for Displaced/Vulnerable Populations*

A nationwide project aimed at enhancing food security and nutrition among displaced and vulnerable populations as well as reducing risk through preparedness and mitigation measures, used a range of approaches: notably cash for work, food for work and food for education. In Sindh, the work schemes had a strong DRR focus, e.g. construction of check dams, flood protection walls, as well as rehabilitation/construction to enhance livelihood opportunities, e.g. feeder road rehabilitation, land clearance. While the project was successful in supporting livelihood recovery among affected populations, targets for communities maintaining acceptable food consumption were not met. This could be accounted for by the adoption in the province of the cash for work approach – in turn indicating a need perhaps for food for work schemes, or for some other modality to be used that fosters livelihood recovery as well as enhanced food consumption.

A number of factors were highlighted in evaluation reports of the project as contributing to its success. Firstly, DRR and other schemes were identified and prioritized in consultation with target communities. The project also had a comprehensive beneficiary feedback mechanism, which both informed project design and led to improvements. Secondly, much of the intervention was implemented through government structures and was well-aligned with government strategies and policies (e.g. for agriculture, food security). In the context of treatment of MAM, the shift away from parallel emergency programming to a more sustainable integrated community-based model through the government health system was seen as very positive.

By contrast to the cash for work approach taken in Sindh, the equivalent project in FATA with identical goals, provided food for work and food for education to support returnees and communities affected by conflict. This led – at least in the short-term (assessments were needed of longer-term impact) – to an improvement in food consumption compared to the baseline. Similarly, a UN initiative in 950 villages across six Agencies of FATA which provided participants with family rations in lieu of work in construction/rehabilitation schemes, reported that 71% of targeted households reached acceptable food consumption level (against a target of 80%).

### *Building Local Capacity for Production of Supplements to Treat Malnutrition*

A UN project was successful in promoting local capacity for production of lipid-based nutrient supplements (LNS) to treat SAM and MAM. The project helped develop a chickpea-based recipe, since chickpeas are a traditionally eaten food in Pakistan. It then partnered with existing private sector food manufacturers to enhance their capacity to produce LNS products. The UN



provided technical assistance and procured the LNS product, but made no financial investment in the manufacturing process. The success of that initiative led to a similar venture to produce LNS for treatment of MAM: in 2013 over 10,000 MT of this LNS were produced. Critical factors in the success of the project were: the fact that there was already a food processing industry in Pakistan; high level commitment on the part of the UN agency and private companies; provision of technical assistance by the UN; and the focus on ensuring the LNS recipe took into account energy and micronutrient content, product stability and - crucially - local taste preferences. While the project was extremely successful, reduced demand for LNS products by the UN led to some manufacturers abandoning production. This has serious implications for capacity to scale-up production in the event of another crisis. Some means to ensure sustained baseline production within Pakistan needs to be found.

#### *Livelihood Restoration through Cash-for-Work Projects in Sindh*

A UN livelihood/DRR cash for work project in Mirpurkhas, Sindh, provided beneficiaries with cash, which many used to buy grain. It also supported crop production, which again was used to meet daily consumption needs. People in the district used to experience food shortages for 4-6 months in a year, but due to the project interventions, this fell to 2-3 months. The timing of the intervention – falling in the normally ‘hungry’ months – was critical, in helping getting through this difficult period. However, the duration was not sufficient to see them through the entire ‘hungry’ period – pointing to the need for future such interventions to be designed for a longer duration, or for the project period to be kept flexible to address target communities’ needs.

Similar results were seen in Tharparkar where 1,000 households were engaged in livelihoods/DRR activities through the cash for work (CFW) modality. Typically, people would face food shortages for 5-6 months in a year –causing people to migrate in search of work in other areas, and exposing families to all kinds of risks. Thanks to the project, migration was not needed as work could be found locally. Beneficiaries reported spending 70% of the CFW income on food; they were able to buy wheat flour and commodities to sustain themselves for 4-5 months.

The UN project supporting livelihoods and DRR expanded in scope from three districts of Sindh in 2013 to six districts in 2014. Direct cash support as well as cash for work enabled beneficiaries to acquire grain stock for on average 5-7 months, and thereby improve food security. The project evaluation report noted that the incidence of distress sale of livestock and other assets to meet food needs was reduced, as was dependency on borrowing of cash for food items; migration to other areas for work also declined.

In any development/humanitarian need situation, the question arises of what is the most appropriate aid modality? – direct food assistance, conditional grants (cash for work, cash for education, etc) and cash transfers. The UN largely used direct cash transfers as well as cash for work modalities in Sindh. An appraisal of the impact of cash transfers in Sindh found improvements in food consumption as a result of cash for work programmes, with households consuming significantly more of nutritious food items such as milk, fruits, vegetables and meat. A common fear with cash transfer programmes is that these will lead to inflation. However, the Sindh appraisal report found no adverse impact of cash interventions on markets and prices was seen. As noted earlier, however, in some projects with the cash for work modality, beneficiary communities did not meet food consumption targets. This points to the need for

analysis of the context – notably market analysis - before deciding aid modality; functioning open markets are a key requirement for preventing inflation. Other advantages of cash transfers are that they allow beneficiaries to buy food commodities of their choice. The distribution costs involved are far less than those for distribution of direct food assistance.

#### *Livelihood Recovery Project in Sindh*

A UN livelihood recovery project in two districts of Sindh, Jacobabad and Kashmore, carried out various interventions to promote food security, e.g. cash transfers, provision of agricultural inputs such as seeds and fertilizer, promotion of vegetable gardening and poultry rearing. The project evaluation report found that the overall drop in food consumption had been arrested. However, while there was a huge drop in proportions of residents falling in the 'poor' and 'acceptable' FCS<sup>10</sup> categories, there was an increase in the 'borderline' category. Perceptions of food security and self-sufficiency in food for a longer duration were higher among beneficiaries than non-beneficiaries.

#### *Treatment of Malnutrition in Balochistan*

Balochistan poses particular challenges with regard to provision of health care services, because the area is so large but the population small – it is Pakistan's least populated province. A UN project provides a successful model for community management of acute malnutrition with potential for high coverage and scale up, both in Balochistan and beyond. The project trained lady health workers (LHWs) to identify (using a simple colour coded tape) and treat (using an LNS product) moderate acute malnutrition cases. Pregnant and lactating women (PLWs) found to be thin were also given suitable treatment. The programme was operational in seven districts and 40% children needing moderate acute malnutrition (MAM) treatment were able to access it. For cases of severe acute malnutrition (SAM) identified by LHWs, those with medical complications were referred to health stabilization centres and those without complications to a BHU with an outpatient therapeutic programme (OTP). However, with only eight OTPs in the province, many did not get treatment.

The evaluation noted that the belief that OTP can only be conducted at a health facility staffed by doctors had prevented the Department of Health from treating SAM through LHWs. It recommended that LHWs should be enabled to treat SAM cases without medical complications, adding that this would require greater investment in recruitment and training of LHWs. The evaluation also recommended that treatment for MAM and SAM – currently separate – should be simplified through the development of a common product for both. This is because SAM cases were not being given the treatment for MAM ('Acha Mum') but since many couldn't access health facilities with OTPs, ended up getting nothing. A common product would prevent this.

#### *Approaches to CMAM in Punjab and Sindh*

The review of community management of acute malnutrition (CMAM) compared approaches taken in Punjab and Sindh in the wake of the 2010/2011 floods disaster. In Punjab the government recognized that SAM was a persistent problem and took steps from the outset to integrate SAM treatment (OTP) into primary health care services. Strong leadership played a critical role in this. Integration of OTP into the primary health system resulted in good quality

---

<sup>10</sup> food consumption score

programming and an evident increase in demand and uptake for other services such as expanded programme of immunization (EPI), family planning and infant and young child feeding (IYCF). Challenges remain, notably insufficient LHWs. Based on the Punjab experience, a key lesson for governments seeking to integrate the management of SAM into ongoing health services is to establish strong leadership and coordination from the outset, and have a clear policy and strategy for handover and scale up, which includes human resource needs. The training and deployment of large numbers of LHWs is central to the successful integration and scale-up of CMAM.

The evaluation reported the opposite experience in Sindh, where during the flood emergency of 2010/2011 the full package of SMAM was implemented by NGOs. While the CMAM programme achieved very good outcomes with cure rates exceeding 95%, the programme was functioning in emergency mode, in parallel to the health system and was thus resource intensive. The evaluation noted that there had been no integration of nutrition programming with primary health care, and identified weak government leadership as a big factor in this.

**Application of UN Programming Principles:  
Gender Equality, Human Rights Based  
Approach and Environmental Sustainability**

## 7.1 Programming Principle 1: Gender Equality

Gender equality was one of the four cross-cutting themes in the Pakistan One UN Programme I (2009-13). While much progress was made under OPI in promoting gender equality, a key lesson from that experience was the need to further deepen and up-scale the UN System in Pakistan's focus on gender equality and human rights, both as approach and goal. These findings informed One Programme II preparation, and led to the inclusion of gender equality and social justice as one of the six Strategic Priority Areas of OP-II. This is, of course, on top of the principles of gender equality and HRBA being applicable across all six SPAs.

Progress under SPA5 Gender Equality and Social Justice has already been reviewed in Part I of this report. This section of the report looks at the approaches taken to promote gender equality across OPII and the achievements to date. As will be seen, there is clear evidence of the application of the gender equality principle in all areas of OPII. This is by far the UN programming principle that has been most uniformly and successfully 'integrated' in OPII implementation.

Efforts for gender equality promotion under OPII fall into the following broad categories: advocacy and policy support to create an enabling legislative and policy environment; support for gender-disaggregated research to provide an evidence base for effective planning; advocacy and capacity building to integrate gender in planning and development processes and in humanitarian responses; support for women's participation in decision-making and politics; interventions to meet specific service delivery needs of women (e.g. MNCH); promotion of access to justice for women; and skills enhancement of women and support for income generation.

UN engagement at provincial and national level contributed to **substantial achievements in strengthening legislation** to combat violence against women and to protect children. The UN provided technical assistance leading to passage of Domestic Violence Bills in line with CEDAW in Sindh, Balochistan and Pakistan Administered Kashmir, as well as to the formulation (and in some cases adoption) of provincial frameworks on gender equality. The National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) and other stakeholders were supported to develop a 'national statement' on EVAWG, which was presented at the 57<sup>th</sup> Commission on the Status of Women in New York, and which introduced a 12-point plan on the way forward for policy and legislation to bring about EVAWG. In Punjab, the UN helped bring about passage of a Bill for establishment of the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women.

In relation to **child protection**, UN efforts contributed to passage of the 2014 Child Marriage Restraint Act in Sindh, raising the age of marriage of girls from 16 to 18 years. Legislative enactments/reforms and policy reviews underway include Child Protection Acts in Sindh, Balochistan and Punjab; Prohibition of Employment of Children Acts in Punjab and Balochistan; and Child Marriage Restraint Acts in Punjab and KP. In addition rules, guidelines and curricula relating to Minimum Standards for Children in Alternative Care, Standard Bye-Laws on Birth Registration, and SOPs for child protection units were drafted and are at various stages of endorsement. The UN also carried out advocacy to increase political support for family

planning, with the goal of increasing programming and budgeting for reproductive health and family planning.

In Sindh and KP, labour departments were assisted by the UN to review **labour laws** and make these more gender equitable. The UN was instrumental in helping governments in Balochistan, Punjab and Sindh to endorse and implement the Gender Responsive Labour Inspection (GRLI) toolkit to collect labour inspection data. Home-based workers (HBW), the majority of whom are women, are not covered by laws in Pakistan. However, in 2013 the Sindh and Punjab Assemblies passed resolutions to adopt a law for HBW.

The UN's focus on provincial level legislation and policies is consistent with the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, devolving substantial powers and responsibilities to provinces. The UN engaged intensively with the Inter-Provincial Ministerial Group (IPMG) on Women's Development to prioritize and address key women's issues. This is significant because, as the only inter-provincial coordination forum, the IPMG has the potential to promote provincial level support for women's empowerment in line with national and international commitments.

**Gender disaggregated data** is critical to planning and implementing effective interventions to support women. The UN provided support for research and collection of such data in a number of sectors. Technical assistance was given to health management information systems at federal and provincial levels to collect sex-disaggregated data, which will inform provincial health strategies and help ensure that health service delivery addresses the diverse needs of all groups, notably women and girls. The UN carried out assessments of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) staff capacity to collect gender disaggregated data – this will help PBS develop a national coordination mechanism for collection of such data. UN advocacy led to over 50 federal ministries providing – for the first time – gender-disaggregated data on employees, showing that no more than 5% women are employed in each. The UN supported the ECP to develop an improved elections results management system – effectively used in the 2013 elections – with, for the first time, sex-disaggregated figures for votes cast, allowing turnout of women voters to be analysed.

The UN supported a number of **studies/knowledge products for formulation of gender responsive policies/plans and evidence-based decision-making**. Critical analysis of budgetary allocations and expenditures in national and provincial budgets was carried out, specifically with regard to the informal sector, gender issues and home based workers. A study conducted by the UN and PARC reviewed women's role in agriculture in different provinces, and identified the constraints faced by female farmers – thereby providing an evidence base for designing interventions. The UN supported an international conference on achievement of MDGs 4, 5 and 6 in 2014, which promoted sharing of best practices across the South Asia region for reduction of population growth rate as well as maternal mortality and infant mortality rates. In the wake of the 2013 elections, the UN commissioned a study on violence against women in politics.

UN assistance helped strengthen monitoring and reporting in relation to international gender commitments, notably CEDAW and UPR. UN engagement with the Inter-Provincial Working Group (IPWG) on Women's Development and advocacy, led to the IPWG adopting a set of key indicators on CEDAW reporting in November 2014. The key indicators and a standard reporting format are being institutionalised by the CEDAW Provincial Committees, after which

they will develop standardized tools to collect information. The UN also supported the NCSW, EVAWG Alliance and other stakeholders to prepare the National Review Report 20 years on from the 1995 Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action. The Beijing+20 Report was submitted by NCSW to the government for onward submission.

Humanitarian crises have become a regular phenomenon in Pakistan, whether from natural or manmade disasters. The UN worked to promote **integration of gender concerns in DRR planning**. Its efforts led to gender being mainstreamed in the 2014 Balochistan Monsoon Contingency Plan and DRR Plan, and to development by the NDMA of the National Strategic Gender and Child Cell Framework and Work Plan (2014-17), which focuses on gender in disaster responses. Women also featured strongly in 'on ground' humanitarian interventions by the UN. Following the 2014 conflict in North Waziristan Agency that displaced thousands from their homes, the UN's multi-sector humanitarian response spanned health, nutrition, water and sanitation education and child protection, and particularly targeted women and children. Female-headed households were among those supported to get CNIC so they could register for government assistance. In response to the food crisis in Tharparkar in 2014, the UN set up a nutrition stabilization centre and feeding programmes for children and pregnant and lactating women.

The UN played an effective role in **promoting women's participation in politics and decision-making**. The UN's work with the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) led to it adopting a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in December 2013, and to key elements of the strategy being included in the ECP's Strategic Plan for 2014-18. A massive voter education campaign encouraging people – especially women and youth – to vote, reached over 40 million citizens, and contributed to the 55% turnout in the 2013 general election (up from 44% in 2008).

UN efforts contributed to setting up of a Standing Committee on Women's Empowerment within the Balochistan Assembly. Women Parliamentary Caucus (WPC) at provincial level aim to promote and increase women's participation in politics, legislation and decision-making. The UN supported the drafting of Strategic Plans for four provincial WPC. It also organized meetings and a series of policy seminars, bringing together stakeholders such as the national and provincial WPC and ECP, to discuss specific aspects such as the quota system for women parliamentarians. The UN was able to take this national initiative to regional level at a South Asia Forum in Nepal in 2014, bringing together women parliamentarians, election bodies and others from across South Asia. The result was a regional commitment for a regional agenda to promote women's political empowerment and to initiate collective measures to tackle violence against women – identified as a major hurdle to women's empowerment in all fields.

**Promoting service delivery specifically geared to meeting the needs of women and children**, was a major focus area of the UN's work. Infants and children, pregnant and lactating women and adolescent girls were targeted through various large-scale feeding programmes and through community-based management of acute malnutrition (CMAM). The school feeding programme in FATA proved particularly effective in that it led to increased school enrolment and attendance by girls and reduced drop-outs. Lady health workers proved similarly effective in taking nutrition messages to rural communities – traditionally with less access to health services – and in promoting practices such as exclusive breastfeeding of babies under six

months of age. The UN carried out extensive training of LHWs so they could perform this role in all provinces.

The UN supported development of a National Maternal, Newborn and Child Health (MNCH) Acceleration Plan to enhance progress towards achievement of MDGs 4 (reduce child mortality) and 5 (improve maternal health), and it supported the health departments of KP and Punjab to develop an integrated package for delivery of the expanded programme of immunization (EPI), maternal newborn and child health (MNCH) and nutrition services. Bi-annual mother and child weeks (MCWs) reached millions of children and women: their success led to provincial governments taking over the planning and funding of MCWs. The UN End Fistula Campaign supported one national and six regional fistula centres providing free obstetric fistula treatment and patient rehabilitation.

**Capacity building of service providers to tackle maternal and newborn mortality** has featured strongly in the UN's work. The Pakistan Nursing Council (PNC) was supported by the UN to strengthen midwifery education and regulation, including through a new midwifery degree course in Karachi. Provincial Maternal Neonatal and Child Health Programmes and the Midwifery Association of Pakistan were similarly assisted to improve midwifery education and training, and raise the image of the profession. A UN MNCH initiative prepared 17 core trainers to teach skilled birth attendants (SBAs) in ten districts of Sindh; the helping babies breathe training is an important measure to reduce birth asphyxia. Medical colleges in Punjab and KP were supported to include IMNCI training in undergraduate courses for doctors, and there are plans to similarly include ENC and PNPNC in pre-service training. The UN supported the development of standards, guidelines and training manuals to strengthen MNCH. It helped establish centres of excellence for training and skill development across the country, equipped with modern technology and facilities.

The UN also worked to build capacity of care providers at prevention of parent-to-child HIV transmission centres, in particular to strengthen service provision and referral for HIV-positive pregnant women. Technical assistance from the UN enabled scaling up of community outreach methods in provincial **AIDS control programmes**: 'family health days' and other initiatives provided women with confidential HIV counselling and testing, and information on safe practices and behaviours. The UN promoted gender responsiveness in harm reduction services (prevention of HIV and drug use) and targeted female groups such as female drug users and female prisoners.

The UN developed a roadmap for establishing a national **gender-sensitive health insurance scheme** for marginalized women and children. To increase access to family planning, the UN launched the Family Planning Voucher – an innovative health financing intervention benefitting thousands of poor and vulnerable women in 11 remote and disadvantaged districts. Distribution of 5,605 vouchers in 2014, led to 3,891 being redeemed and an estimated 2,783 unintended pregnancies being averted.

The UN made significant progress in raising awareness of **sexual and gender based violence (SGBV)** and in capacity building of duty bearers to address this, as well as facilitating victims to report abuse and access support services. The establishment by the UN of women friendly spaces (WFS) in KP provided comfort and security, and enabled many women to register cases of violence they had experienced, leading to several cases being processed. The success of this



UN initiative prompted the Government of KP to take over responsibility for the spaces/centres – ensuring sustainability - with further such facilities planned. To ensure GBV is effectively addressed by the public health system, the UN supported formulation of the National Protocol on Treatment and Health Sector Response to GBV; provincial action plans for implementation of these protocols were subsequently developed in all four provinces and capacity building undertaken of health sector professionals in responding to GBV and gender-sensitive health planning. UN engagement on the issue led to a GBV sub-cluster being set up under the protection cluster as part of the emergency response in Bannu district of KP in 2014. The UN also supported monitoring and reporting by civil society bodies on SGBV as well as HIV.

The UN worked to promote **economic empowerment of women** through vocational training and skills development, as well as facilitating women to secure labour rights. Agriculture was a particular focus area in relation to livelihood promotion for women. UN interventions included training on crop management, provision of quality seeds and stock, vaccination of livestock and guidance on marketing and developing value added products.

Trainings and workshops for over 2,000 home-based workers (HBWs) enabled women to better lobby for registration, greater recognition and protection in the workforce. Some 18,000 informal HBWs were supported through skills development, guidance on income generation opportunities and accessing social security/health benefits, and assistance through micro-credit schemes – enabling them to participate more fully in the formal economy.

## 7.2 Programming Principle 2: Human Rights Based Approach

The human rights based approach in OPII design and implementation is manifest most obviously in measures taken to promote child protection, labour rights, fair elections, media freedom, monitoring and reporting on human rights, and to tackle sexual and gender based violence. It is also seen in the stress placed on ensuring vulnerable and marginalized groups – women, refugees, people with HIV and so on – have access to rights and services. However, there are a number of areas where OPII implementation appears to have fallen short, notably in strengthening accountability systems and in building capacity of national stakeholders to promote and protect human rights.

Significant achievements have been seen in relation to **child rights and child protection**. UN efforts contributed to approval or drafting of Child Marriage Restraint Acts (raising the age of marriage for girls), Child Protection Acts and Prohibition of Child Employment Acts in a number of provinces, and notification of Children's Commissioners for federal and provincial ombudsman systems. The UN supported the Government of Pakistan to review and amend the Juvenile Justice System Ordinance 2000 (JJSO) to ensure full compliance with the CRC and the Beijing Rules (for administration of juvenile justice). UN technical assistance to the Ministry of Human Rights enabled it to draft a bill for the National Commission on the Rights of the Child.

The UN spearheaded the first-ever comprehensive mapping and assessment of child protection systems in Sindh, Punjab, KP, Balochistan and GB respectively. It also developed innovative new modules for a child protection information management system: the strengthened system is being piloted in districts in all four provinces. The UN also strived to provide young people access to reproductive health services, and to promote effective policy-making for youth through establishment of the Punjab Youth Parliamentary Caucus.

A major focus of UN efforts was **promoting birth registration**: both raising awareness of the importance of this, and building capacity of governments to carry this out. Interventions included: a systematic bottleneck analysis to identify the causes of low birth registration rates with the findings used to devise provincial strategies to address the issue; support for South-South learning on birth registration schemes; a national campaign on birth registration launched in 2013; advocating successfully for waiver of the late registration fee – a potential deterrent for many parents; and integrating communication of birth registration messages into the work of LHWs and polio community social mobilizers.

The UN's work on labour rights included **tackling child labour and bonded labour**. The UN played a key role in bringing about a major seven-year project in Punjab addressing all aspects of child and bonded labour: strengthening legislation, building capacity of government bodies, supporting rehabilitation of freed labourers, promoting knowledge sharing with other provinces. The provincial government is providing funds for that, as is the KP government for child labour units. In Balochistan, the UN carried out baseline studies to identify the scale of child labour in the province, thereby enabling evidence-based policies to address it. As well as government, the UN has partnered with other stakeholders, notably the Pakistan Workers Federation and the Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP), providing them technical assistance to lobby the private and public sector to implement International Labour Standards

(ILS) and tackle child and bonded labour. UN support to the EFP led to the drafting and adoption of codes of conduct regulating child labour in nine hazardous sectors. The UN was also instrumental in promoting labour rights for women - detailed in the section above on gender equality.

In the wake of the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, the UN provided technical assistance to provincial governments to ensure that new **labour laws were aligned to international standards**. As of end 2014, 25 labour laws had been enacted across the four provinces (13 in Punjab, 10 in KP, 2 in Sindh and 1 in Balochistan). The UN also supported the federal and provincial governments in strengthening labour administration, including labour inspection and occupational safety. Tripartite committees on labour administration – with representation of government, employers and workers – have been formally notified at federal and provincial level.

The UN supported the **entrenchment of democratic norms** in Pakistan through both support for the Electoral Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to promote free and fair elections, and capacity building of parliamentarians to fulfil their responsibilities. The UN assisted the ECP in carrying out other major improvements in electoral systems. It worked with the ECP and NADRA to improve the electoral roll through measures such as adding voters' photos and removing duplications. A further safeguard against ballot stuffing was the addition of information requirements on results forms: total number of registered voters, and total number of votes cast.

The UN supported Parliamentary Committees in conducting public hearings and consultations, carrying out outreach (communications), conducting research, and carrying out effective government oversight. In 2014 the UN provided technical and operational support for the establishment of Parliamentary MDG Task Forces at federal and provincial level, aimed at strengthening parliamentary oversight towards accomplishment of the MDGs. Measures to promote women's participation in elections and politics, and to strengthen Women Parliamentary Caucus, have been described in the preceding section.

The UN carried out a number of interventions in KP to **promote access to justice** through capacity building of duty bearers: the police, prosecution service, courts and the prison service. **The focus in relation to rights holders was on vulnerable groups: women and refugees.** In KP the UN supported training of community paralegals and *jirga* members, improving quality of alternative dispute resolution. It also set up legal aid desks and mobile legal aid clinics to raise awareness of rights among communities (notably women) and provide legal assistance. UN support for women to report cases of sexual and gender based violence (SGBV) and to access services has been described in the preceding section. The KP Social Protection Policy was drafted with UN input; this was subsequently approved and the KP Government now has a fully operational Social Policy Reform Unit. The new policy has been piloted in two districts, with District Social Protection Committees notified and trained.

For **refugees**, Advice and Legal Aid Centres (ALAC) were set up across the country. These provide legal assistance to refugees in cases of arrest, detention, SGBV incidents, civil or family disputes. The UN was able to assist many Afghan refugees in obtaining Proof of Registration (PoR) cards, and helped hundreds of arrested or detained PoR cardholders. The UN undertook mass awareness raising campaigns about the voluntary repatriation programme in refugee

villages, enabling people to make informed choices, and assisted those seeking to return to their homes. Grievance redress and protection was provided by the UN for large numbers of IDPs displaced from North Waziristan Agency (NWA); thousands – including many female headed households - were assisted to obtain CNIC, a requirement for IDP registration.

The UN also conducted awareness raising sessions on **refugee and human rights law** for key stakeholders such as the police, border officials and prosecutors. It continued its engagement with the Government of Pakistan to ensure the achievement of international refugee rights, and to bring about appropriate policies and referral systems distinguishing between refugees and migrants.

Pakistan is one of the most dangerous countries in the world for journalists and the UN made efforts to **promote safety of journalists and media freedom**. Pakistan is one of five pilot countries for the UN Action Plan on Safety of Journalists and Issue of Impunity, launched in 2013. The campaign highlights the responsibility of governments to protect journalists from threat and to combat impunity, and aims to help countries strengthen legislation and mechanisms for freedom of expression and information. As part of this effort in Pakistan, the UN organised four large-scale advocacy events to create impetus for better protection for journalists and media workers and to raise awareness of the importance of freedom of expression. The UN Action Plan was endorsed by the Government of Pakistan in October 2013. The UN also supported implementation of right to information legislation in KP.

The UN engaged with both civil society groups and government bodies to promote **better monitoring and reporting on human rights**. It worked with civil society groups to support monitoring on sexual and gender based violence, HIV, people who inject drugs, transgender and other sexual minorities. The UN itself conducted a review in 2014 of legislation, policies and institutional frameworks (in particular access to HIV and health services) to safeguard the human rights of these key groups affected by HIV; this established a baseline and provided evidence-based recommendations for improvement.

UN engagement with the Inter-Provincial Working Group (IPWG) on Women's Development and its advocacy on improving **monitoring and reporting on CEDAW and UPR**, led to the IPWG adopting a set of key indicators on CEDAW reporting in November 2014. The key indicators and a standard reporting format are being institutionalised by the CEDAW Provincial Committees, after which they will develop standardized tools to collect information. The UN also supported the NCSW, EVAWG Alliance and other stakeholders to prepare the National Review Report 20 years on from the 1995 Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action. It also assisted the government in preparing the 5<sup>th</sup> periodic report on the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.

### 7.3 Programming Principle 3: Environmental Sustainability

Application of this third UN programming principle in OPII implementation has largely been in the context of SPA2 (promoting sustainable livelihoods) and SPA3 (tackling climate change). Interventions and progress under those SPAs have been detailed in Part I of this report and hence are only given in brief here. Efforts to ensure environmental sustainability have also been made in relation to other SPAs, as described below. Overall, however, the principle of environmental sustainability has been applied far less uniformly across OPII than either gender equality or the human rights based approach.

As part of its commitment to promoting sustainable livelihoods the UN supported measures for **clean production**. Technical guidance was provided to government as well as refrigeration sector manufacturers to enable Pakistan to comply with its obligations under the Montreal Protocol to phase out release of ozone depleting substances (hydrochlorofluorocarbons or HCFCs). The Sustainable Consumption and Production (SCP) Centre was set up to mainstream SCP within environmental, economic and broader sustainable development planning and policies.

To promote **clean energy use**, the UN supported various projects using biomass gasification technologies for power generation and for thermal applications – with the dual benefits of reducing carbon emissions and reliance on the national grid. The UN's Cleantech programme for SMEs focused on various aspects of clean energy such as renewable energy and energy efficiency. A key aim of the initiative is to encourage entrepreneurship in the field of environmentally friendly energy technology. The UN also supported the government in carrying out a situation assessment and subsequently developing a road map for sustainable energy solutions in Pakistan. At community level, the UN promoted improved heating and cooking methods (cutting wood consumption) and distributed solar lamps (reducing CO<sub>2</sub> emissions).

The UN supported **implementation of the National Climate Change Policy** at 15 sites of critically threatened ecosystems across the country through an integrated approach to biodiversity conservation and livelihoods promotion. It contributed to conservation work in the wetlands and in juniper forests. In Balochistan interventions for sustainable land management, aimed at combating desertification and drought, led to large tracts of semi-desert land being converted into productive farmland. Support was also provided to the Balochistan Forestry and Wildlife Department to carry out rehabilitation of forest lands. The UN worked to revive the international 'Man and Biosphere Programme' in Pakistan after a long dormancy. UN engagement with the federal Climate Change Division (CCD) led to notification of a national habitat committee, with provincial counterparts in the pipeline. These will promote improved urban development practices, particularly in relation to land governance, slum up-gradation and climate change adaptation.

Environmental sustainability featured strongly in **WASH interventions**. The UN HySter campaign aimed at bringing about behavioural change in communities, and specifically promoting safe excreta and waste disposal. Similarly the Pakistan Approach to Total Sanitation (PATS) helped hundreds of thousands of people gain access to secure sanitation facilities (as

well as safe drinking water) reducing environmental pollution. Provincial Water and Sanitation Policies, which the UN helped develop, featured mainstreaming of environmental sustainability. In addition, the UN helped draft an Environmental Health Action Plan, both to reduce the environmental burden of disease and to ensure people are safeguarded from environmental hazards and risks.

UN interventions to support **refugees and IDPs** also featured environmental sustainability prominently. In trainings provided by the UN on Camp Coordination and Camp Management (CCCM), environmental sustainability was mainstreamed into every phase of the camp cycle – set-up, maintenance and closure, with particular emphasis on responsible clean-up and disposal of waste when closing camps. IDPs/refugees were provided with stoves and gas to reduce the need for wood and thus preserve tree stocks. For people returning to areas damaged by disasters, reuse of salvaged materials wherever possible was encouraged, and shelter repair kits (including doors and window frames) filled gaps in available resources for rebuilding to prevent deforestation in return areas.

Other examples of the environmental sustainability principle being applied in OPII implementation are training of prison officials in safe disposal of contaminated materials, and promotion of relevant measures in livelihood schemes, e.g. land levelling by farmers, construction of water reservoirs and lining of water courses to ensure more efficient water use.

## Conclusion

The assessments of progress and of application of UN programming principles were most useful for identifying shortcomings/gaps in OPII implementation, while the main lessons for future OPII implementation/programming emerged from the meta-review.

This report shows that OPII implementation is progressing well in all SPAs and key achievements are being seen in most joint outcomes (as detailed in the relevant chapters). However, some joint outcomes have significant gaps with joint outputs that are not being addressed at all. These are the following: joint output 1.1.3 – strengthening accountability systems and structures, and access by rights holders; joint output 1.3.3 – supporting provincial governments to put in place long-term human resource management strategies and plans; joint output 3.2.3 – establishment of clean production centres for water management in select industries, and set up of a web-based portal for exchange of data between India and Pakistan on trans-boundary water issues; joint output 4.1.3 – enabling civil society and media to promote participation of people in democratic processes and public dialogue; joint output 5.1.3 – building capacity of civil society and women’s groups to lobby for implementation of women-friendly legislation and demand accountability; joint output 5.3.1 – building capacity of national stakeholders to promote and protect human rights. More effort is needed to ensure progress in these.

With regard to application of UN programming principles, gender equality is the principle being applied most strongly across OPII; there are gaps in application of HRBA and environmental sustainability tends to be applied in select sectors only.

As noted, the meta-review provided the richest source of lessons. This is to be expected given the large number of evaluation reports and agency reports that were examined for this. Many of the lessons to be derived are issue-specific (e.g. how to effectively produce supplements to treat malnutrition), and have been given in the relevant SPA sections. However, there are also many common themes and lessons which emerge. These are presented here. The points given below were selected either because they cropped up in multiple SPA reviews or because they have relevance across the whole of OPII.

**Stakeholder engagement is critical:** This needs to take place at all levels (as appropriate) – local, district, provincial and national. Stakeholder engagement helps ensure effective coordination, implementation and sustainability. Moreover, many programmes entail multiple interventions addressing diverse aspects of the same issue – and hence requiring support from multiple stakeholders.

**District-level institutional arrangement for engagement:** Again and again the review highlighted the critical role played by district level bodies which bring together diverse stakeholders. These provide opportunities to forge partnerships with multiple government agencies, allow rights holders access to decision-makers and enable duty bearers to understand people’s issues and needs. In the long run, this promotes effectiveness of programme interventions and sustainability.

**Alignment with government strategies, policies and plans:** The closer programme interventions are aligned with what government is doing, the greater the chances of scale-

up/adoption of those interventions by government. The role of the UN is to support government in implementing *its* vision. This is not to say there is no place for innovation or piloting of new approaches, but consideration should always be given to how those will fit into and strengthen existing government programmes.

**Work through government systems rather than set up parallel systems:** It can often be easier, particularly in humanitarian crisis situations, to engage NGOs and other local implementing partners to quickly and efficiently carry out interventions and achieve project targets. In the long-run, however, such approaches undermine the public sector and they are not sustainable. Every effort should be made to work through the public sector or at least have a strategy in place for handover to the public sector.

**Avoid use of subsidies/incentives to achieve programme objectives:** Again, these can be an effective incentive to engage stakeholders and achieve programme targets. The danger with these, however, is what happens when the programme ends and subsidies are removed? – there is a risk that interventions will come to an end. Sustainable alternatives should be sought to incentivise target communities, approaches that are not dependent on external funding.

**Highlight direct and indirect benefits of interventions:** The experience of OPII programme implementation to date shows that often there are significant indirect or unplanned benefits, in addition to those that were anticipated (e.g. providing sanitation facilities in the home reduces the risk of gender violence as women no longer need to go out in hours of darkness). Highlighting these can help bring about behaviour change and encourage stakeholder participation.

**Community participation is vital:** Programme interventions can gain from local knowledge and experience and, wherever possible, local development schemes should be identified and prioritized in consultation with local communities. This will promote effectiveness and build ownership.

**Interventions should be adapted to local tastes and preferences:** Again, it is important to ensure that practices or products being promoted by a programme are suited to local preferences.

**Involvement of the private sector to fill gaps/partner public sector:** Private sector entities can play an important role in supplementing the public sector. It can sometimes be more cost-effective to engage private sector partners to carry out certain tasks – within the overall framework of public sector service delivery. This is particularly in remote areas where public sector provision would be difficult. The UN can support private sector engagement through provision of technical assistance.

**Support local production capacity:** Related to the above point, the private sector should be facilitated to generate cheap, local products (e.g. vaccines, nutrient supplements) – avoiding the need for more expensive imports. Again, the UN can provide technical assistance for this. Having local production capacity is particularly important to deal with increased demand during crisis situations.



**Improved coordination between UN agencies:** Though not an overwhelming issue, a number of evaluation reports did flag poor coordination between UN agencies involved in implementing a programme. More effort and resources need to be put into ensuring coordination.

**Less can be more:** Programme interventions aiming at bringing about long-term change, e.g. livelihood restoration/generation among vulnerable populations, can sometimes be more effective by concentrating intense efforts on a few, rather than spreading support out thinly over many. While an ideal situation would be to provide intensive support to everyone in need, given the reality of resource constraints, funds could sometimes be more effectively spent helping smaller groups.

**Promotion of gender equality:** The experience of OPII implementation to date shows again and again the potential and opportunities for promoting gender equality – even in programme areas that might not appear obvious candidates for such interventions. All programmes should proactively identify and implement activities to support and empower women.

# ANNEXES:

## Annex 1: Meta-Review Analysis Framework

*Report Title:*

*Name of Project:*

*Problem Addressed:*

*Objectives:*

*Duration:*

*Cost:*

*Geographic Scope:*

*UN Implementing Agencies:*

*Partners:*

*Contributes to SPA:*

*Contributes to Outcomes/Outputs:*

*Main Components:*

*Key Achievements:*

*Challenges/Shortcomings:*

*Successes/Success Factors:*

*Lessons Learned/Recommendations (where relevant):*

***Application of HRBA:***

***Application of Gender Equality:***

***Application of Environmental Sustainability:***

***Summary of Key Points for Meta-Review:***

## **Annex 2: List of Documents Reviewed**

### **A. Programme Reports**

#	Report Title	Project Dates
1	Mid-Term Evaluation of the UNDP/AF Reducing Risks and Vulnerabilities from Glacier Lake Outburst Floods in Northern Pakistan	Nov. 2011-Dec. 2015
2	Final External Evaluation: Promotion of Energy Efficient Cooking, Heating and Housing Technologies (PEECH)	May 2009-June 2013
3	UNDP National Environmental Information Management System: Terminal Evaluation of the Project	Completed May 2013
4	Mid-Term In-depth Evaluation of the Country Programme Promoting the Rule of Law and Public Health in Pakistan (2010-2015)	Period covered in report: July 2010-Nov 2013
5	Evaluation of the UNICEF Sanitation Programme at Scale in Pakistan (SPSP) – Phase I (2013-14)	2013-17: Phase I 2013-14
6	WFP-UNICEF Review of CMAM in Sindh, Punjab and Balochistan: Case Studies and Success Stories	2013
7	End of Project Evaluation: Norway-Pakistan Partnership Initiative (NPPI)	2009-2014
8	WFP Enhancing Food and Nutrition Security and Promoting Social Cohesion: Standard Project Report 2013	Jan-Dec 2013
9	WFP Enhancing Food and Nutrition Security and Promoting Social Cohesion: Standard Project Report 2014	Jan-Dec 2014
10	WFP Pakistan PRRO Enhancing Food and Nutrition Security and Rebuilding Social Cohesion: Evaluation Report	Jan 2013-Aug 2014
11	How WFP provided specialized nutritious food to 1.5 million children in Pakistan	2008-2014
12	Mid-Term Evaluation of Development of a Framework for the Progressive Control of Foot-and-Mouth Disease in Pakistan GCP/PAK/123/USA	Aug 2011 - June 2014
13	External Evaluation of the IOM-Led Shelter/NFI Cluster in Pakistan 2010-2013	Aug. 2010-Dec. 2013
14	WFP Appraisal of the Impact of Cash Interventions on Markets and Household Food Security	2013
15	WFP Appraisal of the Impact of Cash Interventions in Sindh	March-July 2014
16	WFP Support to Livelihoods and Disaster Risk Reduction in Sindh by ECHO in 2013-2014	2013-2014
17	WFP Support to FATA for Recovery, Rehabilitation and Disaster Risk	2014

	Reduction 2014	
18	WFP Livelihood/DRR through Cash for Work Project: Case Study Tharparkar, Sindh	Jan-June 2014
19	WFP Livelihood/DRR through Cash for Work Project: Case Study Mirpurkhas, Sindh	Jan – May 2014
20	WFP Assistance for Early Recovery of Livelihoods and Disaster Risk Reduction: Assessment of WFP Interventions in Sindh Province	2013-2014
21	WFP Improving Resilience and Food Security in Drought Affected Areas of Tharparkar	Jan – May 2015
22	UN-WFP Initiatives Towards Building Capacities through Training and Awareness Raising Activities	2013-2014
23	WFP Provision of Cash Based Assistance to People with Special Needs/Vulnerable People Displaced from North Waziristan Agency	2015 (?)
24	Livelihood Restoration and Protection and Sustainable Empowerment of Vulnerable Peasant Communities in Sindh Province: Mid-Term Review Report	1 Jan 2013-31 Dec 2015
25	Mid-Term Review Towards Gender Equality: Women's Economic Empowerment – Home Based Workers Phase II	2013-2015
26	Impact Evaluation Report: DFID-funded livelihood recovery interventions in areas affected by 2012 floods	Launched June 2013

## B. UN Annual Reports

#	UN Agency Report	Year
1	WHO Pakistan Biennial Report	2012-2013
2	UNODC Annual Programme Progress Report	2013
3	UNODC Annual Programme Progress Report	2014
4	UNFPA Country Office Annual Report	2013
5	UNFPA Country Office Annual Report	2014
6	FAO Annual Report on Country-Level Results and Performance	2013
7	FAO Annual Report on Country-Level Results and Performance	2014
8	ILO Pakistan Decent Work Country Programme II Annual Report	2013
9	ILO Pakistan Decent Work Country Programme II Annual Report	2014
10	UNESCO Project Reports	
11	UNDP Annual Report	2013
12	UNDP Annual Report	2014
13	UNICEF Annual Report	2013
14	UNICEF Annual Report	2014
15	UNIDO Final Country Evaluation Report	2014
16	UNAIDS Biennial Report	2013-2014
17	UNHCR Country Operations Plan	2013
18	UNHCR Country Operations Plan	2014
19	OPII SPA reports	2013-2015